

2011

TASK FORCE REPORT ON URBAN DEVELOPEMENT

January
Planning Commission, Government of Pakistan
2011



Table of Content

1.	INTRODUCTION	5
2.	THE STATE OF URBANIZATION IN PAKISTAN	7
2.1	Brief History.....	7
2.2	Existing Conditions and Their Causes and Repercussions	8
3	THE TASK FORCE VISION AND PRINCIPLES.....	9
4	ISSUES, CAUSES AND REPERCUSSIONS FOR URBAN.....	10
4.1	Demographic Change (Natural Growth, Emigration and Migration)	10
4.2	Urban Economy.....	11
4.2.1	Issues.....	11
4.2.2	Principles and Facilitations	12
4.3	Urban Poverty	14
4.3.1	Issues.....	14
4.3.2	Principles and Facilitations	16
4.4	Urban Land.....	16
4.4.1	Issues.....	16
4.4.2	Principles and Facilitation.....	18
4.5	The Existing Legal Framework and its Negative Repercussions.....	19
4.6	Building Byelaws and Zoning Regulations.....	20
4.6.1	Issues.....	20
4.6.2	Principles and Facilitations	22
4.7	Physical Infrastructure.....	23
4.7.1	Water & Sanitation Issues.....	23
4.7.2	Principles.....	23
4.7.3	Facilitation	25
4.8	Social Infrastructure: Large, Medium, Intermediate and Small Towns.....	26
4.8.1	Issues.....	26
4.9.2	Principles.....	28
4.9.3	Facilitation:	28
4.10	Housing and Real Estate and its Relationship to Land, Industry and Finance.....	29
4.10.1	Issues.....	29
4.10.2	Principle and Facilitations.....	30
4.11	Urban Transport.....	33

4.11.1	Issues.....	33
4.11.2	Principles.....	34
4.11.3	Facilitations.....	34
4.12	Environment	35
4.12.1	Issues.....	35
4.12.2	Principles and Facilitations.....	36
4.13	Urban Security	37
4.13.1	Issues.....	37
4.13.2	Principles and Facilitation.....	37
5	GENERAL CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	38

Abbreviations

ADB	Asian Development Bank
CDB	Central District Business
CDG	City District Government
CDS	City Development Strategies
DA	Development Authority
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
FAR	Floor Area Ratio
GDP	Gross Domestic Production
GIS	Geographic Information System
HBFC	House Building Finance Corporation
HH	Household
HIV/AIDS	Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
HU	Housing Unites
IT	Information Technology
KBCA	Karachi Building Control Authority
KDA	Karachi Development Authority
LDA	Lahore Development Authority
LG	Local Government
NEQS	National Environmental Quality Standards
NGO	Non-government Organization
NSS	National Spatial Strategy
NWFP	North-West Frontier Province
O&M	Operation and Management
R&D	Research and Development
SME	Small and Medium Enterprise
STDs	Sexually Transmitted Disease
TDR	Transferable Development Rights
TMA	Town Municipal Administration
TEPA	Traffic Engineering and Planning Agency
TOR	Terms of Reference
TEVTA	Technical and Vocational Training Authority
UN	United Nations
URC	Urban Resource Centre
WASA	Water and Sewage Authority

1. INTRODUCTION

“We have entered the urban millennium.... Cities are engine of growth and incubators of civilization.....But the very same cities can also be the places of exploitation, disease, violent crime, unemployment and extreme poverty..... In any case reality’s message is plain enough; we must do more to make our cities safe and liveable places for all.”

Kofi Anan – Inaugural address to Urban 21(2000)

By 2030, it is estimated that Pakistan will be predominantly urban with 49.8 per cent of its population living in urban areas and about 17 cities becoming larger than one million people. Past demographic trends show that the country’s population has been rapidly urbanizing, with an annual rate of urbanization exceeding four percent.

An urban area, or urban population, is understood to be one whose primary activity or source of income is removed from the practice of agriculture or animal husbandry.

The urban population recorded during the 1998 Census, was nearly 43 million and is currently (2009) estimated at 57.3 million. To absorb such a massive number of people in the urban areas and provide them shelter, food, employment, healthcare and educational facilities, municipal services and recreation are the challenge of the present and of the future. These challenges are made more difficult as existing urban facilities and resources, over and above strapped finances, unskilled manpower and governance issues, are already in short supply.

Urban areas demonstrate immense economic potential to generate and spread growth in the country. Economic activity in urban areas produces at least 78 percent of the national wealth (GDP) of Pakistan. Similarly they have been instrumental in enhancing prosperity and increasing per capita income to US\$ 1,046.

Although the subject of urban development is a provincial issue and the subject of urban planning is a local issue, the immense contribution and, indeed, economic potential, of urban areas to national trade and the economy gives the Federal Government of Pakistan good reason and strong basis to suggest areas of reform.

It would be a mistake, however, to think of urban areas as merely places where economic and commercial activity takes place. Urban areas and cities have, through history, been places where human activity and interaction has produced culture and civilization.

To enable urban areas, to make them more economically efficient and vibrant while at the same time ensuring such development is equitable and socially inclusive, it is important for policy makers at the Federal level to focus on and address the challenges of urbanization.

It is against this background that, vide Notification dated 28 June 2010, the Deputy Chairman of the Planning Commission of Pakistan constituted a Task Force on Urban Development chaired by Mr. Arif Hasan. The composition of the Task Force and its Terms of Reference are available

at **Annexure A**. Broadly speaking, the Task Force was to review urban conditions existing in the country and devise a consensus agenda for realization of the following, inter alia, objectives:

- To make Pakistani cities and urban areas become strong; liveable, prosperous and functional in all dimensions - physical, social, economic and with improved governance;
- To make Pakistani cities and urban areas become competitive and perform their role as engines of economic growth;
- The development of quality infrastructure that supports urban development.
- A review of land-use and building regulations as well as laws and policies relating to urban planning and development to see:
 - how competitive cities are;
 - how compatible they are with growth;
 - how attractive they are for investment;
 - how inclusive they are;
- To ensure Pakistani cities are empowered, well-managed and governed by institutions that further equitable and socially inclusive development; and
- To create new knowledge to understand and resolve urban issues.

This report is an outcome of deliberations of the Task Force extending over five meetings held at the Planning Commission in Islamabad. In these meetings the Task Force reviewed all the available analytical work including the work done by an earlier “Working Group on Urban Development” constituted by the Planning Commission in 2009 under the chairmanship of the Secretary, Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development for the preparation of 10th Five Year Plan. The members of the Task Force presented papers on various problems faced by the urban areas and, respecting legal and Constitutional jurisdiction over urban planning and development, recommended a number of policy measures for implementation at the Federal level.

Divided into five following chapters, this report provides a comprehensive account of urbanization process, identifies major issues confronting towns and cities, analysis existing urban policies and makes several recommendations to reform the urban sector. This Report begins with a description of the state of urbanization in Pakistan and then sets out the vision of Task Force. Thereafter, the compilations of the papers presented by the embers of the Task Force are set out according to the major themes and issues identified by the Task Force. In conclusion, this report ends with general conclusions and recommendations.

2. THE STATE OF URBANIZATION IN PAKISTAN

2.1 Brief History

In 1981, about 24 million people were living in urban areas that represented 28 per cent of Country's total population. The 1998 Census revealed that the urban population increased to 43 million and that it then constituted 32.5 percent of the total population (143 million). The total population of the Country has now (2009) risen to 162.32 million and the urban population to 57.32 million, thus increasing the level of urbanization to 35.3 percent of the total population. The United Nations (UN) estimates that the urban population of Pakistan will increase to over 50 percent of the total population 2020.² In absolute numbers the urban population would surpass an estimated figure of 90 – 100 million. This would be the highest level of urbanization amongst the south eastern Asian countries.

These figures have been questioned in relation to the urban population for three reasons. Firstly, that for the 1981 and the 1998 census the definition of urban was changed to mean only those human settlements which had municipal governments. In the earlier definition, settlements of 5,000 and above population which had urban characteristics could be considered as urban. As a result of this change, 1,483 settlements of over 5,000 were not considered as urban in the 1981 Census. Secondly, administrative boundaries of most urban areas do not include their peri-urban settlements. And thirdly, “ribbons of development along highways, between major centres and industrial satellite areas have developed, largely due to accessibility to transport links, availability of skills and services and tariff incentives”¹. These developments have urban characteristics but are not classified as urban.

The ongoing urbanization in the country is characterized by four features. Firstly, the urban areas have become the major contributors to the national economy, generating and diffusing growth across the country. They contribute overwhelmingly to country's gross domestic production (GDP) (over 79 per cent) and also towards the government's revenues. The rising per capita income in the country at the rate of 13 per cent per annum to US\$ 1,046 by 2008 is largely due to increasing productivity of the urban economy.

Secondly, the pattern of urbanization across Provinces exhibits large variation. According to 1998 Census, 49 per cent of population in Sindh was living in towns and cities followed by the Punjab (31 per cent) and Balochistan Provinces (23 per cent). In the NWFP province only 17 per cent population was living in urban areas.

Thirdly, there has been over concentration of urban population in fewer urban areas. More than half of the total population of the urban areas of the country is clustered in and around eight cities i.e., Karachi, Lahore, Faisalabad, Rawalpindi, Multan, Hyderabad, Gujranwala and Peshawar. Urban regions/clusters/areas have sprung around these large cities and consist of economically, infrastructure and ecologically related/inter-dependent towns, villages and “ribbons of development.” Examples are Karachi and Lahore City districts, the Gujranwala,

¹ Raza Ali; *How Urban is Pakistan*, November 1999

² UN World Urbanization Prospects, 2009

³ ADB poverty assessment, 2008

Faisalabad and Lahore triangle, and the Mansehra to Hassan Abdal corridor interspersed with medium and small towns.

The fourth important feature is an expanding middle class comprising of youthful and skilled labour force. Women in gainful employment are increasing. The incidence of poverty has declined in the recent decade from 22.7 per cent to 13.1 per cent, even though about 7.1 million people in cities live below the poverty line.³

Rural urban complementarities have further deteriorated, and the Local Government Ordinance 2001 have neither removed the disparities nor improved resource base of the rural urban unions i.e., Town Municipal Administrations (TMAs) and City District Government Governments (CDGs).

2.2 Existing Conditions and Their Causes and Repercussions

Historically, the people and society of Pakistan and South Asia have participated in rural and agriculture-based living. Urbanism has been the exception, not the norm. The structure of government evolved in the country reflects this historical character. However, recent trends in urbanization and demographic change have taken the existing structure of government by surprise. The Task Force undertook an overview of the existing conditions in urban areas with its explanation of their origins and cause. A summary of these conditions is as follows:

- Lack of understanding and capacity to manage urbanism
- Unregulated urban property market
- Distortion of prices of urban real estate
- Real estate development suppressed by byelaws and zoning regulations
- Automobile dependent urban sprawl
- Housing development catered to elite and not need based
- Low density, anti-pedestrian, anti-street, anti-mixed land use and anti-dissolved space central business districts and commercial centres
- Displacement of settlements due to development and relocation of low income communities at urban peripheries
- Discrimination and high transport costs due to lack of public transport
- Unavailability of developed land to urban poor
- Poorly designed civic architecture
- Poor urban services and infrastructure resulting in environment and health hazards as well as disrupting economic activity
- Absence of properly planned and appropriately located transport and cargo terminals, wholesale markets, warehousing and storage areas

The Task Force also found that land around smaller towns is owned either by big landlords, small farmers or by the revenue department. The big landlords as such determine the nature and shape of urban expansion; the small farmers associate with developers to create informal low income settlements through the subdivision of agricultural land; and the political representatives and bureaucracy use land as an instrument for political patronage. This has resulted in a major

environmental disaster both for the urban areas and for the villages around them. This also has critical implications for security and governance.

The three other important repercussions of growing urbanization in the country are; One, the poverty issue in Pakistan which centres on unemployment, absence of housing, education, health, transport and security. Two, the lack of an environmental, social and economic ambience in the medium and small urban centres has forced the better educated and enterprising individuals and communities to migrate to the larger towns. This is especially true of women who have acquired education. As a result, such towns lose their political importance, impoverishing them further. And three, in all cases, the contemporary culture related aspirations of the people of Pakistan cannot be fulfilled. It also explains the need to support and promote local trade and commerce (with credit, infrastructure, space and negotiations) which is the backbone of the economy and which has been neglected in the past.

The growing urbanization has placed enormous demands on financing of matching urban development activities. The local governments continue to depend on transfers from the provincial governments and have not attempted to mobilize other resources including private sector investment. The provincial government transfers hardly suffice the salaries of employees and little is left to initiate new development. The existing legal framework within which urban areas operate (a mixture of local government and development authorities) is not and cannot cater to the problems and challenges of large cities and urban areas.

3 THE TASK FORCE VISION AND PRINCIPLES

The Task Force sees urban areas where capital, especially real-estate, is available in open-market conditions; where high-density and mixed land-use urban areas are inclusive, self-sustaining, economically vibrant. The Task Force believes that urban areas are places of culture, learning and ideas whose development is based on promoting liveability, creativity and harmony and well-being of citizens irrespective of class and ethnicity.

Given existing conditions, the Task Force believes the following initiatives are required in order to make its vision a reality:

- Land and real-estate must be made available
- Property speculations must be curtailed and regulated
- The real estate market should be made transparent and competitive
- Job and investment opportunities must be created in order to attract and be involved in international networks
- Creativity and local skills must be supported
- Attractive and environmentally friendly living and working conditions must be created
- Low-income housing must be supported through market and subsidy based mechanisms
- Densification, rehabilitation, development and mixed land use should be promoted
- Design excellence should be enforced
- Public transport should be available, irrespective of class, age or sex
- Pedestrian and commuter friendly cities, neighbourhoods and communities should be promoted

- Built heritage should be protected and adapted
- Culture and entertainment should be supported

Laws, byelaws, zoning regulations and policies that impede these initiatives should be reviewed and, where appropriate, amended to bring in into conformity with the Task Force's vision.

The Task Force is also of the view that urban development has been affected by a deregulated global economy. Long-term urban planning and development has been replaced by project-based urban development. The lack of cohesion among the many urban development projects has negative social, economic and environmental impact on urban areas. To make urban development projects socially, economically and environmentally appropriate, the Task Force recommends the following criteria to be applied in their evaluation:

- Projects should not damage the ecology of the region in which the city is located
- Projects should help determine land use on the basis of social and environmental conditions and not on the basis of land value alone
- Projects should serve the interests of the majority population, which in the case of Pakistan consists of poor communities. Such projects should not promote dislocation and poverty
- Projects should support and/or promote the tangible and intangible cultural heritage of the communities that live in the cities
- Elite commercial and entertainment related activities such as malls, ciniplexes, etc. should be supported but along with them properly planned hawkers' bazaars and economic activity for the lower income groups should be developed to create an inclusive economic, physical and social environment
- The commuter-hawker-informal services sector link should be respected and space developed for it at transport terminals, parks, playgrounds, etc

Credit facilities for the purchase of land for housing should be promoted so that access to the land market is created for the lower and lower middle income groups.

4 ISSUES, CAUSES AND REPERCUSSIONS FOR URBAN

4.1 Demographic Change (Natural Growth, Emigration and Migration)

20 per cent of the urban population of Pakistan is under 25 years of age. As such, urbanization has to cater to the needs of a young population. In addition, in the urban areas the social indicators of the age group 15 – 25 years have changed considerably. Literacy in this age group in 1991 was 58.28 per cent. In 1998 it has increased to 71.65 per cent with 73.65 per cent for Karachi. Female literacy also increased from 51.05 per cent to 66.70 per cent with 71 per cent for Karachi, between the inter-census years. Major changes have also taken place in marriage patterns in this age group. In 1981, 27.07 per cent of this age group were married as opposed to 20.09 per cent in 1998 (11.59 per cent for Karachi). In 1981, 16.07 per cent men and 41.54 per cent women were married as opposed to 11.15 per cent men and 29.86 per cent women (28 per cent for Karachi), in 1998. In addition, education attainment figures also show a marked improvement.

The fact that there are now an overwhelming majority of literate unmarried adolescents, means a major change in gender relation, family structures (creation of nuclear families, working women, middle class values) and aspirations and the search for contemporary cultural and social values. Urban policies related to education, entertainment, culture and recreation have to cater to this new reality. However, there are major differences between the different regions. For example, female literacy in the age group of 15-24 in urban Punjab is 71.16 per cent as opposed to 40.13 per cent in Balochistan.

In spite of these positive trends, un-employment in the urban areas in Pakistan has increased from 5.22 per cent in 1981 to 19.13 per cent in 1998. According to media reports, it seems that the incidence of poverty (number of people rendered poor) is also increasing due to inflation, recession and the absence of market related skills.

Important changes are also taking place in settlement patterns. In 1981, 38.8 per cent of Pakistan's population lived in three cities whose population was over one million. In 1998, 49.7 per cent of Pakistan's urban population lived in seven cities of over one million people. Populations living in cities of between 500,000 and 999,999 declined from 14.5 per cent to 4.9 per cent but there was an increase in the population of cities between 200,000 and 499,999 from 4.5 per cent to 9.1 per cent. Most of these smaller towns are located in the neighbourhood of the one million plus towns and along the National Highways. This means that we will now have to plan for urban regions, agglomerations and clusters rather than individual towns and cities.

Migration to the urban areas is also increasing and has to be taken into consideration in economic and landuse planning. According to the 1998 Census, 10.8 million Pakistanis or 8 per cent of the total population are migrants. Over 63.7 per cent have migrated to urban areas. 25 per cent of total migrants migrated to Karachi, Lahore and Rawalpindi which are all large cities where job opportunities are available. 13 per cent of total migrants migrated to Karachi alone and 23.99 per cent of migration was to other countries.

Given the above statistics planners will be dealing increasingly with large and mega cities in the next decade especially those of populations of 500,000 and above and containing a large percentage of migrants. Job opportunities if generated in the smaller cities will spread out migration more evenly. This can be done by supporting local level production (crafts, foods, small industries) trade, commerce and tourism through infrastructure, credit, advice and public-private partnership.

4.2 Urban Economy

4.2.1 Issues

In most developing countries the emphasis in recent years has been away from policies that inhibit urbanization, control internal migration or evict the urban poor residents and resettle them elsewhere. There is now increased focus on proactive planning strategies that rely on providing infrastructure and services to accelerate economic growth in urban areas.

The composition of the population has changed over the years. It is now a young population with more than 50 percent between the ages of 15-34 years which would be at the centre of the urban

development strategy to take into account the requirements of such a population especially related to job creation.

Global trends in urbanization show a strong relationship between urbanization and GDP growth. Pakistan is also poised for a major urban demographic transition as the population of its major cities is growing. More recently, this growth in the economy in most countries is driven by urban based services and growth in the industrial sector. In Pakistan the lack of disaggregated statistics on the urban economy and regional GDP make it difficult to assess the role of cities and the urban centres in the economic growth of the country. But the cities are growing fast and contributing to the economic growth. For example Karachi alone accounts for 60-70 per cent of national revenue and 40 per cent of value added in manufacturing sector. However, the changing structure of the economy indicates that in Pakistan the economic growth has been increasingly driven by the manufacturing and the services sector. Although agriculture continues to be a significant sector the contributions of manufacturing and the services sector has grown considerably with substantial increase in the contribution of the services sector.

The informal sector also plays a major part in developing economies absorbing some 30 to 70 per cent of urban labour force, reflecting an inability of the modern formal sector to absorb the urban labour force. Sectors like construction, wholesale and retail trade, transport and communication and even manufacturing operate with a very high proportion of informal employment.

According to the Competitiveness Report 2009, Pakistan ranks high in the “doing business” indicators. There is therefore an urgent need to improve the ease and efficiency with which business can be conducted in urban areas.

4.2.2 Principles and Facilitations

The following recommendations are made to improve the business environment, competitiveness and to promote the urban economy:

- Expand inner city markets

Due to the informality of living conditions and market opportunities in inner-city areas, there has been severe under-counting in population and market potential which otherwise hold good prospects for enhancing services and attracting investment. Market intelligence can help cities attract investment in often overlooked inner-city areas. The Inner-city Market Assessment piloted in Bogota and Johannesburg, which uses data-mining techniques to uncover under-served markets in urban areas and attract investment, broaden retail services and create jobs, should immediately be undertaken in Pakistani urban areas.



Karachi Market

- Promotion of City Cluster development

The City Cluster economic development process can be useful in promoting economic growth in urban areas. The existing practice of “ribbons of development”, linear commercialization along inner-city roads and sprawl-induced multiple commercial and central business districts must be reviewed. Urban development should promote City Cluster development. Advantages of City Clustering are multiple and they promote economies of scale.

- Capacity Building

Capacity building (and appropriate research) to improve local government management of urban areas is essential without which the city cluster development concept cannot work. Local government management and control must be supported by a competent bureaucracy. At present, the bureaucratic structure takes more experienced officers and moves them to the provincial and federal capitals and removes them from the local level. The scheme of bureaucracy and its support of urban governance needs to be redefined with urban planning and management being highlighted.

- Skill Development



Urban development and redevelopment cannot be undertaken in economically equitable and environmentally sensitive manner unless and until the people involved in the constructions of buildings, roads and other urban

infrastructure are not adequately skilled. Skill enhancement and improvements in building techniques can be induced through the introduction of technical and other skills training to the labour and contractors that actually undertake the construction work. A system of construction qualification must be introduced. Such a qualification system, it is proposed, can follow the master/apprentice model. Skills training must be provided in areas such as plumbing, masonry, electrical works and so on. Master plumbers/mason/electricians and so on can be “listed” by a relevant authority (TEVTA or by a local government).

- Sub-national Government Financing:

The Federal and Provincial governments have devolved service-delivery and expenditure responsibilities to the local government level but have retained control over significant revenue sources. Federal and Provincial governments have tended to maintain decision making power over taxes that can be levied locally, the tax rates, and user service fees that local authorities can charge for basic service delivery. Local governments seldom tap the full

range of local revenue sources available to them - most local governments have a narrow fiscal base and limited discretion over own-source revenues. The local governments therefore should be given financial autonomy and encouraged to raise more revenues from local taxes.

4.3 Urban Poverty

4.3.1 Issues

The poverty problem in Pakistan is traditionally considered to be a rural phenomenon and has received attention accordingly. Poverty alleviation is considered a problem that can be addressed by rural development. For these and other reasons, relatively less attention has been devoted in the country to urban poverty. However, given present and projected demographic shifts, as Pakistan's population become a predominantly urban population, poverty will increasingly become an urban characteristic. However, urban poverty is different from rural poverty in that it will be a health issue more than a development issue. Urban centres must prepare for increased burden on health infrastructure as a result of urban poverty.



Rawalpindi

The statistics on urban poverty are mixed. The decade of the 1990s saw a rise in urban poverty levels which increased from 20.9 per cent in 1998/99 to 22.7 per cent in 2001/02, and declined to 14.9 per cent in 2004/05 and further to 13.1 per cent in 2005/06. In absolute numbers about 7.1 million people lived below the poverty line.² These people are characterized by low income levels, lack of access to resources and economic opportunities, poor access to basic urban services and inadequate social protection.

Urban Poverty Estimates

	1992/93	1993/94	1996/97	1998/99	2000/01	2004/05	2005/06
Overall	25.46	28.17	25.78	30.6	34.46	23.9	22.3
Urban	19.99	15.39	15.84	20.9	22.69	14.9	13.1

Source: Pakistan Economic Survey 2007-08 and World Bank. 2007. Pakistan: Promoting Rural Growth & Poverty Reduction. Islamabad

¹. ADB Poverty Assessment Update, Pakistan, December 2008.

Urban poverty in Pakistan in recent years is often attributed to slow economic growth, wage and employment restraints in the public sector, low development expenditure, low private investment, unstable agriculture production, high inflation, and poor governance of social services. Conversely higher growth, creation of greater employment opportunities, a record level of remittances, and increased public sector development expenditures have all been cited as reasons for the decline in urban poverty in recent periods.

Not only has urban poverty been a problem but the country is also characterized by a skewed income distribution in the urban areas. Between 2000-01 and 2005-06, income distribution worsened in the urban areas and overall for the country. The Gini-Coefficient increased from 0.32 to 0.35 for the urban areas during this period. Similarly the income ratio of the highest 20 per cent to the lowest 20 per cent of the urban population increased to 12.98 from 10.4. The key factor contributing to these urban disparities is an unequal distribution of wealth, ownership of land and property and financial assets and an uneven access to social services like education, health, water and sanitation and economic opportunities and a failure to generate revenue for social and physical infrastructure and its O&M by taxing the richer sections of the urban population.

Income Distribution (FY2001- FY2005) in Urban Areas

Years/Areas	Gini Coefficient	Population Income Share		Ratio of highest 20% to Lowest 20%
		Highest 20%	Lowest 20%	
FY 2001				
Pakistan	0.28	38.0	10.1	3.76
Urban	0.32	55.1	5.3	10.4
FY 2006				
Pakistan	0.30	40.3	9.6	4.2
Urban	0.35	58.4	4.5	12.98

Source: Pakistan Economic Survey 2007-08.

The unemployment rate in the urban areas although lower than in the rural areas, remains at 4.7 per cent.³ The decline in the urban unemployment has been accompanied by a rise in the informal employment in the urban areas. The share of employment in the formal sector in urban areas decreased from 32.8 per cent in 2003/04 to 29.3 per cent in 2006-07, while it grew in the informal sector from 67.2 per cent to 70.7 per cent for the same period. The increase in the share of informal sector in urban employment has generated concerns regarding the quality of the jobs being created.

In addition, Pakistan's major cities and urban centres are home to an estimated 1.2 million street children. This includes beggars and scavengers who are often very young. The law and order problem worsens their condition as boys and girls are fair game to others who would force them

² Source: Labour Force Survey 2006-07.

into stealing, scavenging and smuggling to survive. Children are vulnerable to contracting (STDs) such as, (HIV/AIDS), as well as other diseases.

The large increase in prices especially in food prices is a cause of concern for the urban population. In 2009-10 the general prices rose by 20 percent while inflation in food related items was 23.7 per cent. It has been estimated that a 20 per cent rise in food price increases the incidence of poverty as much as 8 percent⁴. The recent rise in petrol prices has made most items beyond the reach of most of the urban poor.

4.3.2 Principles and Facilitations

The difference between rural and urban poverty must be understood before any action can be taken related to urban poverty. Rural poverty is managed by providing important infrastructure, links to markets and roads, education and healthcare facilities. The access to markets and roads leads to economic activity, which is generally accepted to be the means to escape poverty.

Urban poverty does not need to be managed by the construction of new roads or by providing access to markets. Roads and markets already exist in urban areas. Instead, attention should be paid to strengthening employment opportunities for the poor in key sectors through enhancing their employability by focusing on technical education, vocational training and skill development that is in line with market demand. The recommendations regarding skilled construction labour made in the urban economy section above are reiterated.

It is also important to improve and strengthen the targeting of the social protection programs by enhancing coverage, improving targeting, and monitoring their progress.



Lahore

Lastly, it must be understood that, given weak civic infrastructure that often leads to contamination of water, urban air pollution and poor healthcare facilities, urban poverty threatens to be more of a health-related issue than an employment related issue. As the urban environment continues to decay, healthcare infrastructure must be provided in urban areas to combat urban poverty. Good healthcare infrastructure will ensure that meagre incomes are not spent or diverted on medical expenses.

4.4 Urban Land

4.4.1 Issues

Almost all cities are faced with acute shortage of land which has resulted in extremely high land prices. Land at appropriate scale and price is not available for industrial and commercial enterprises and nor for housing and infrastructure projects. Alongside a short supply, the

⁴ Schlichting, Deborah, 2005. ADB Draft Background Paper for Pakistan Poverty Assessment Update. Food Security in Pakistan: A Review of the Literature and Data. Asian Development Bank, Islamabad.

available land is also being used in extremely inefficient and un-economical manner due to extravagant nature of existing land use regulations and planning standards and through informal processes.

Inability of cities to meet the land shortage has led to large scale encroachment on public and private land and proliferation of katchi abadis. The land shortage and consequently its high price have rendered investment in land more lucrative than any other type of capital investment. Land thus held for speculation further increases its values to an extent that makes appropriate development through the existing density related byelaws difficult if not impossible.

Land use in urban areas is controlled by multiplicity of government agencies and political interests. There is very little coordination between them. As a result, there is little by way of cohesive urban planning in urban areas. Individual agencies and interests pursue their agendas within their own jurisdiction. Other than resulting in haphazard urban growth in urban areas, this is economically inefficient and wasteful arrangement.

Land in many of the medium and smaller towns is manipulated by a powerful agriculturists' lobby and acquiring it for planned development is difficult. There are no proper mechanisms to bring to the urban market enough agriculture land for urban use in enough quantity to meet increasing requirements. The Land Acquisition Act, 1894 is frequently employed "in the public interest" for acquiring both private and state land which is a waste of resources, time consuming and fraught with long drawn litigations.

In large towns land is a hotly contested commodity and is planned and disposed off through powerful and often compromised planning agencies and through political and economic pressure of powerful interest groups. These interest groups develop land for sale and use to the urban elite and overlook, often entirely, the needs and demands of the majority. The result is low density elite colonies creating an uncontrolled and automobile urban sprawl. Meanwhile, ecologically unsafe waste lands are converted informally into increasingly smaller lots for low income groups. In many cases, such as Karachi, this informal subdivision of land has a high level of insecurity associated with it since it operates through a system of coercion and corruption.

In medium and intermediate towns planning and controlling agencies are weak. Expansion takes place along the corridors leaving and entering the cities. Much of the development caters to the housing needs of middle, lower middle and lower income groups through informal subdivision of agricultural land. Increasingly, this is becoming formalized except for the lower income groups. There is a need to support and direct this growth through appropriate road and infrastructure projects.

Wholesaling and related warehousing and storage, retailing and other services sector activities are not planned for in these towns. They develop in an ad-hoc manner and subsequently attempts are made to deal with the crisis they create. Commercial activity of all types are increasing in these cities and new lobbies representing transporters, market operators and the real estate lobby have emerged as powerful players in determining the form that these cities are taking. They require better governance systems and the human resources to make them function.

In the smaller towns there is almost no expertise with the TMAs, no maps, no modern surveying equipment, and no future vision for the town. The TMA has to be strengthened and the expertise for it has to be created / acquired.

Holistic urban development is also not taking place in cities. Cash-strapped city district governments turn to provincial and federal sources funding for infrastructure projects. Provincial and federal governments, in turn, obtain the capital to undertake large urban development projects from multilateral funding organizations. Thus, urban development is limited to the projects that can be financed and implemented. There is no urban planning, only “project-based” development.

Transport has not been factored into land use policies and schemes. As a result, the right to mobility, especially the right to mobility of women, children, senior citizens and the handicapped is severely curtailed and amounts to a violation of fundamental rights. By permitting low density and automobile dependent urban sprawl for the urban rich, city sizes have mushroomed. Lack of public transport and a restricted choice of transport options make mobility – and the economic activity it has the potential to unlock – difficult.

4.4.2 Principles and Facilitation

The unregulated conversion of peri-urban agricultural or waste land for housing should be reviewed. Provincial Revenue Departments and urban local governments need to coordinate the conversion of agricultural land. No agricultural land should be converted to any other use without an environment impact assessment of such conversion.

The use of the Land Acquisition Act 1894 for the acquisition of land for housing should be immediately halted. It is debatable that elite-centric housing fulfils the Constitutional requirement of public purpose that the prerequisite to use the Land Acquisition Act, 1894. Instead of resorting to compulsory land acquisition to provide housing schemes for the rich, land should be procured from land owners either on market rates or through land sharing. This step alone will accomplish the important goal of reducing low-density automobile dependent urban sprawl.

Instead, the land supply in urban areas may be expanded through renewal (high density and mixed use) project in the inner areas and promoting densification in the new developments.

Large tracts of state land held by federal and provincial governments at prime locations in the urban areas must be released to augment supply in the market. If unable to release such land on account of their use of it, the Federal and Provincial governments must amend relevant legislation that exempts them from property tax. State land must also be liable to property tax. Further, the relevant disposal regulations set out in this regard need to be transparent and market compatible.

To deal with the multiplicity of urban authorities, the proposal to create a supra-authority under which all other authorities operate has been suggested in the past. As a practical alternative, a forum needs to be provided to these authorities where they can at least share and make public their planning goals, objectives and projects.

Transport, especially public transport, must be a key ingredient in urban land use planning. In fact, civic authorities must not be allowed any further urban development without factoring in the transport-related aspects of such development. In addition, it must be understood that the densities required for economically vibrant cities cannot properly be achieved without providing means of transport. Lastly, the provision of public transport must be equated with the Fundamental Right to Mobility. Only by recognizing the importance of public transport as a Fundamental Right of urban residents will transport be considered during urban development schemes.

An important aspect of the land issue is related to insecurity and coercion, especially for informal developments. This coercion is made possible through corruption and political patronage. The removal / curtailing of these two factors are essential for the implementation of what has been suggested in the preceding paragraphs.

4.5 The Existing Legal Framework and its Negative Repercussions

The responsibility of urban spatial planning vests, under law, with local governments (and, in larger urban areas, with city district governments) and development authorities (DAs) also created under statute. Urban local governments and DAs were intended to work in tandem, with local governments responsible for macro issues such as planning, governance, administration and enforcement and DAs responsible for developing urban areas in response to the needs of the urban population. After the promulgation of the Local Government Ordinances 2001, some urban areas integrated their respective DAs with their local governments (Karachi is an example of where the Karachi Development Authority (KDA) and Karachi Building Control Authority (KBCA) were brought into the fold of the City District Government of Karachi). However, in the urban areas where local governments and DAs continue to exist and operate side by side, the experiment to see if they would in tandem is not working.

In the Punjab, for example, four of the five DAs in the city districts of Lahore, Rawalpindi, Gujranwala, Faisalabad and Multan, the DAs are effectively non-functional. In Lahore, the Lahore Development Authority continues to finance itself through provincial government loans and grants-in-aid or through the mechanism of charging fees for allowing change of land-use in residential areas.⁵ Since urban local governments and DAs are empowered to carry out urban planning and perform service delivery, there is an overlap of jurisdictions. However, DAs, not being local governments, are outside the scope of the provincial government's Annual Development Plan. The provincial government is, in effect, paying two entities to do exactly the same job. This is not only economically inefficient, it is poor governance. DAs must be merged into urban local governments.

In addition to the structural problem highlighted above, there is also a political issue that needs to be addressed in order to strengthen urban economies. The decentralization envisioned in the Constitution relates not just to financial and administrative decentralization. It also envisions political decentralization. Existing local government legislation effectively nullifies independent political decision making at any local level. There is a good reason for this: the combined political mandate of urban areas poses a challenge to the political leadership at the provincial and

federal level. One of the existential questions to be answered by the existing provincial political dispensations before any new exercise in local governments is undertaken is whether it wishes to confront the repercussions of political decentralization. This comment is being made in the backdrop of the decentralization envisioned in the 18th Amendment and the local government legislation yet to be enacted by provincial governments.

4.6 Building Byelaws and Zoning Regulations

4.6.1 Issues

There exist various types of laws, byelaws, zoning regulations and policies that impede efficient and economical use of land in the urban development and renewal schemes. Founded on the principles of healthy and safe environment, social cohesiveness and pleasing aesthetics existing laws and policies tend to prescribe use, height and coverage restrictions on urban land which are not market-favourable and are often violated by the builders and developers to keep their projects feasible and profitable.

These laws, byelaws etc. are mostly anti-street, anti-pedestrian, anti-mixed landuse, anti-high densities and anti-public space. They do not provide sufficient space for amenities such as, schools, health facilities, parks and playgrounds both at a neighbourhood and at a sector and city level. One of the reasons for this is that under the bye laws and zoning regulations space for only large facilities are allocated whereas small neighbourhood facilities are becoming the norm. An understanding and catering to this phenomenon is required. They do not cater to the increasing requirement for appropriately located warehousing, storage, transport and cargo terminals, and for high density housing. Often these regulations are in conflict with the requirements for the protection of the tangible and intangible heritage of the city and do not take into consideration the historic nature of the inner cities of the urban areas of Pakistan.

The inflexibility of these laws, byelaws etc. has seriously affected the quality of architecture and urban design and has suppressed initiatives for design creativity and excellence. Additionally the inflexibility of regulations make process of securing building permissions / no objection certificate tedious, expensive and time consuming. In addition, the absence of a non-utilization fee on land and property skews the land market and development process.

One of the important principle on which these laws, byelaws etc. are founded is land use segregation. A rigid application of landuse segregation is primarily responsible for the development template employed in the cities that prefers automobile dependant and sprawl inducing stand-alone houses, economically inefficient setbacks and restricted building heights instead of generating dense, sustainable and connected communities.

Urban local governments and DAs have also begun resorting to enforcement of bye-laws for the purposes of revenue-generation rather than as a means of coercing better practices and ensuring safety standards. In Lahore, for example, while a moratorium on “commercialization” of residential areas placed on the LDA has seen it lose one of its largest single sources of income, local governments unaffected by the moratorium are now increasing revenues by charging for permission to do exactly the same changes in landuse. Enforcement of bye-laws as a form of rent-seeking must cease.

There is no “condominium law” in Pakistan that sets out the rights and obligations of the tenants or residents of apartment buildings, town-houses or high-rises. Clarity on these rights and obligations is necessary for tenants and residents to enforce their rights against building owners or landlords to effect necessary maintenance and repair work. Often, because of negligence on the parts of building owners or landlords, apartment buildings appear unattractive for the purposes of family living and, as a result, a bungalow in sprawling private housing schemes are preferred for commercial activity.

There still exist some tenant-friendly rent control laws. Together with excessive taxation and fees on urban properties these rent control laws have stalled urban development. Investors are hesitant to put their monies in the construction of residential and commercial buildings for rental purposes. The inheritance laws are also complex that makes securing of clear title of urban property tedious and time consuming. The investors do not risk their investment in properties of unclear title. The cities are therefore being deprived of capital and investment inflows needed to drive their development.

The common practice of “commercialization” of land – that is, permission to use land zoned for residential purposes for commercial or industrial purposes – along roads, otherwise known as “strip development” must also be put an end to.

Commercialization of this type not only distorts property values (owners of land zoned as commercial and industrial do not benefit from the windfalls received by the owners who have “commercialized” their residential property) but it adds to and induces sprawl. Further, it negates the concept of a high density urban centre and the economic and social benefits that come with nodal or area based commercialization.

There is no regulatory body that exists among property dealers that ensures best practices. Every other profession where members of the public are involved is so regulated. Doctors, accountants, lawyers, engineers, architects, stock brokers all need to be registered with a governing body of some sort. Property dealers, in contrast, have no such governing body. The creation of a body that will maintain and monitor standards and practices among property developers will be an important step towards transparency and efficiency in the urban property market.

In addition to the creation of a body regulating property dealers and agents and enforcing professionally set industry standards, it is equally important to devise and implement a system of regulation of the construction sector. Specifically, qualifications should be required before formal sector contractors and labour involved in the construction of homes or other structures undertake building works (similar qualifications already exist for engineers registered with the Pakistan Engineering Congress). Most formal and informal structures in Pakistan are built by such contractors and employ, more often than not, unskilled labour. A system of contractor qualification, which can be arranged in collaboration with the Technical and Vocational Training Authorities on the basis of the *ustad-shagird* model and can ensure that best practices, must be introduced. The Task Force recognizes that this cannot be done immediately for one; skilled labour is not available in sufficient quantity; and two, if this is enforced, it may result in unemployment or the unskilled labour will shift to working only in informal settlements, with disastrous results for the informal sector construction.

There are no building laws or zoning regulations for the katchi abadis which have been regularized. Nor is there a building control authority for them as a result of which they are densifying to an extent due to which there is considerable social and environmental degradation. The setting up of such institutions with rational regulations is necessary.

4.6.2 Principles and Facilitations

- Market Driven Building and Zoning Regulations

There is a growing realization amongst the cities to amend the zoning and building regulation and match the market preferences at different locations and zones. This realization is also supported by the contemporary research which has established, “.....that land use interventions can hurt business as well as consumers.” (Brueckner 2007). There is thus, little rationale for the continuance of the present low density, height restrictive and segregating land use pattern of urban development. The conditions in which the present laws, byelaws etc. were developed have changed and there is no longer any reason to continue to enforce them in blind imitation of the past. The LDA (Classification, Reclassification and Redevelopment) Rules, 2009, for example, has within it the concept of permitted, permissible and prohibited activities within any given landuse area depending on whether the landuse areas is residential, commercial, industrial, peri-urban, environmentally sensitive or historically important. Similarly in the case of Islamabad, the low value of floor area ratio (FAR) and number of storeys (height) which was earlier prescribed for aesthetic reasons have been modified upward in response to market requirements. Large residential plots are also allowed to be subdivided into small sized plots and building coverage has been increased to allow densification and compact development in most of the public sector housing schemes.

The other provisions of the laws, byelaws etc. such as levying commercialization charges also need to be reviewed. These were initially levied to recover charges on the up-gradation of infrastructure required as a result of commercialization and densification of residential properties. However the commercialization charges now being realized are very high and do not stand the earlier rationale. Rather these have become severe constraint on development of rental premises for residential and commercial purposes.

Under the recently promulgated “Punjab Rental Premises Act 2009” the tenant bias has been neutralized to a large extent. Eviction is now possible on completion of tenancy period as mutually agreed and special Rent Tribunals are being established to expedite decision on rent related disputes.

A “condominium law” that sets out the rights and obligations of occupants of buildings such as apartments is also necessary. It will act as a backbone giving support to the densification that will follow apartment-style accommodation over sprawl-inducing bungalows.

It is essential that some manner of regulation be brought in the real estate sector. Property dealers must be required to pass some manner of certification process that ensures a minimum knowledge of property law, property conveyance and the dynamics of a property market. The public must not be left to the mercy of unqualified and unregulated individuals in the manner it is now.

4.7 Physical Infrastructure

4.7.1 Water & Sanitation Issues

Physical infrastructure continues to deplete in quality and its coverage is exceedingly inequitable; the poor stand deprived and disadvantaged – for water they pay exorbitantly to water vendors. The present level of coverage of water and sanitation in urban areas is stated to be 85 per cent and 65 percent respectively but authenticity of these statistics is often questioned.

Management of service delivery is also a big issue. An important deficiency in this regard has been lack of capacity of local governments to generate enough funds for the operation and maintenance of existing networks. Often there are no incentives for improved operation and management (O&M) and assets tend to deteriorate much earlier than their usual life. For major projects, the local governments are dependent on the assistance of provincial and federal governments. The public sector investment in the sector is very low, at 0.25 per cent of the GDP. In spite of the government's interest and encouragement for the involvement of the private sector, the latter's participation has been nominal.

Local governments suffer technical, financial and administrative weaknesses in planning and in O&M related issues, especially related to energy requirements. These are also over-staffed agencies with an absence of adequately trained and professional manpower.

Underground sources of water supply are fast depleting due to heavy withdrawal and surface water is threatened with municipal discharges and pollution. Cities are increasingly faced with scarcity of water and poor quality of supplies. On the other hand 35 to 40 per cent water is wasted through leakages in the water distribution net works. Water treatment facilities are also limited.

Sewage is collected through open drains in most of the cities and discharge into rivers, streams, lakes and canals without treatment. These channels often become sources of urban water supply schemes. The collection through piped net works is limited to very few large cities where too the coverage is selective and sewage treatment rare. Additionally in small towns incidence of open defecation is not uncommon.

Only 5 per cent households have proper access to municipal garbage collection systems. Often there is no arrangement for its disposal at properly developed landfill sites. The un-collected garbage accumulates on streets, and open spaces between houses from where scavengers extract the useable material for recycling and leave the rest to rot.

4.7.2 Principles

- Sewage:

Gravity flow systems should be a priority even if there design requires many disposal points instead of one. This will considerably reduce O&M requirements and improved efficiency.

Sewage should be diverted to treatment plants in large parks so that it can be used for horticulture purposes (as it is being done in Karachi). Similarly, in small towns, it should be diverted for use in agriculture and revenue should be generated from its sale.



HUB WATERTREATMENT PLANT - C4

At present, most sewage flows into the natural drainage channels of the towns or is pumped into canals. Trunks should be laid on either side of the natural drainage channels so as to pick up this sewage and treatment plants should be built at locations that are subservient to this decision.

The process of building open drains for sewage disposal in small towns should be discontinued. All sewage flow should be through an underground system.

- Water:

Absence of energy completely upsets the functioning of water supply systems. The use of solar power is an expensive but in the long run a more efficient, reliable and cheaper source of energy. Its use for pumping purposes should be made compulsory.

Gravity systems should be preferred even if the capital costs are more because ultimately the O&M costs will be considerably lower.

There should be bulk water metering for specific purposes and areas so that water theft and usage can be easily monitored.

- Solid Waste:

In larger towns all recycling activity should be shifted to landfill sites. If this is done, there will be an incentive for all formal and informal actors in the solid waste collection drama to move their recycling activities to the landfill sites. They will become interested in being involved in an appropriately designed process. Studies have shown that it is more economical and easier to operate if instead of one landfill site supported by a number of transfer stations, there are instead a number of landfill sites at different locations around the city.

Private sector involvements in solid waste management should be studied to remove the constraints they have faced and to strengthen their potential.

The development of environmentally safe incinerators and composting for smaller town should be studied, developed and implemented.

- Roads and Pavements:

Pavement construction should be an integral part of all road construction within the towns. Where development has not taken place, curb stones should clearly define the road area.

All road construction and street paving should be supported by an effective open and paved drainage system so that road surfaces are not damaged. This is something that is usually not done.

Pavements should be large enough for comfortable movement and trees, sign posts, street lights etc. should be placed in a manner that does not obstruct pedestrian and vehicular movements. It should be a joy to walk on a pavement in cities.

Where aggregate for concrete construction is not available or is costly, all pavements should be paved in burnt brick and so should all neighbourhood streets, community spaces and roads. This will boost the local economy, be climatically friendly and aesthetically pleasing.

4.7.3 Facilitation

To make the above possible, TMAs, WASAs and other agencies have to be strengthened. The first step towards this is the preparation of a digitized map of the existing city/neighbourhood infrastructure and an evaluation of its problems related to revenue versus expenditure, O&M and manpower issues, and to make development subservient to existing availability of funds rather than a search for loans and international inputs.

Local government, TMA and other departments dealing with infrastructure have to be supported by research and extension by academic and professional institutions and by NGOs.

There is a large volume of research on the above subject and a number of successful government and NGO projects on the subject. Their scaling up or adaptation should be studied and integrated into government planning.

The most urgent task required at all levels of local governments and service delivery institutions are the introduction of IT for surveying and mapping and its digitalization. The training of manpower for this purpose is a priority.

The above facilitation processes cannot possibly be carried out without training programmes for those involved in the design, provision, and operation and maintenance of infrastructure. The training, to be effective, has to be collective (designers, implementers, O&M personnel and administrators). The necessary institutions for such training already exist in some form or the other. Their courses have to be linked to the field and to successful programmes and projects in the country.

4.8 Social Infrastructure: Large, Medium, Intermediate and Small Towns

4.8.1 Issues

Cities are losing social, cultural and entertainment activities and the infrastructure that support and promote these activities such as art galleries, theatre, cinemas, exhibition halls, fair and festival grounds, parks and playing fields, public meeting places, city halls, tea & coffee houses art schools, libraries all are close to extinction. Socio-cultural and entertainment activities tend to play in leading economic diversification, improving bankable image, enhancing social integration and engage expanding younger generation to healthier activities. The urban development policies should therefore, focus to address un-explained disdain against cultural and entertainment activities and ensure a full scale revival. There is no better way to do this than to promote high density, mixed use urban areas with opportunities for public recreation.

Entertainment, recreation and culture in the urban areas consist of three types. First the folk culture that surrounds shrines and displayed during religious events. By and large, these are badly organised and the venues for them do not have the infrastructure to cater to the activities that are performed or for the needs of the visitors to these events, the hawkers that gather to serve the visitors or for the traffic that these events generate.

Second the cinemas, parks, and theatres that caters to the requirements of all sections of the urban society. Cinemas had almost disappeared in the 1980's and 1990's. However, there is a revival now but it has many constraints that need to be removed. Parks do not cater to hawkers, performers. On the contrary, these activities are officially persecuted and increasingly people have to pay to access parks and recreation areas. In addition, there are a number of neighbourhood cultural activities that have difficulty in taking place due to the absence of public space where they can be performed and because of a retrogressive state culture.

And third, there are museums, art galleries, theatres, seminars, workshops, film festivals etc which are organised and attended by the elite, academia and middle classes. However, they do not seek to involve (except in a few cases), students, lower middle and working class neighbourhoods and nor do they make an impact on the physical ambiance of the urban areas.

This is in spite of the fact that all the urban centres of Pakistan contain considerable talent both traditional and contemporary. In these centres there are musicians and singers, poets, journalists, artists and traditional story tellers. Post-1980 state culture does not help in the promotion of talent in the fields discussed above. The lack of public open spaces and mobility provided by public transportation are also reasons this talent remains untapped.

The community groups, individuals and NGOs in many neighbourhoods, in both large and small towns in Pakistan, promote libraries, clubs and local sports facilities. However, they do not receive sustainable support from the local government, NGOs, private sector and charity organisations.

The older urban areas of Pakistan contain extraordinarily beautiful architecture which is slowly being replaced by substandard concrete construction. We are loosing our heritage and identity. The country has no National Heritage Charter and no department of conservation at any

university. We have conservation laboratories but no building material chemists. There is a lack of awareness among government officials and the general public on this important issue.

The governance related institutions that can facilitate the private sector, local communities, interest groups, professionals, academia and cultural activities to grow and expand and create an inclusive, economically viable and socially and intellectually creative society are also lacking. In the absence of an effective governance system, people are forced to seek the support of their clan and tribal affiliations thus undermining democratic processes and institutions.

There is a lack of space for schools, health institutions, sports facilities, recreation, entertainment and cultural activities both at the town and neighbourhood level. There is also an absence of support from government and private sector institutions for these activities.

Although a number of private universities have sprung up, there is an absence of institutions for training para-professionals and technicians which are the back bone of social sector facilities, industry and commerce.

Most Pakistan towns have a number of folk festivals and traditional cultural events (for example around shrines). However, these are badly organised in terms of administrative management and spatial organisation. They can be made into attractive and aesthetic events with improved spatial organisation.

Parks and playgrounds have been built in many towns. However, they do not cater to populist culture such as hawkers, performers, musicians and other entertainers that are available in the town/city.

The cinema is the cheapest and most easily accessible of organised entertainments. Due to negligence and persecution, it has declined considerably. In addition, the cost of all entertainment has increased to an extent that it is no longer accessible to the poor.

There are a number of elite organised cultural events but they do not reach the lower and lower middle income groups. This in turn fragments the city both in physical and social terms.

There is no local government strategy to promote culture. Its involvement is limited to supporting certain events. In this case too there are laws that restrict the freedom to perform and organise events.

The built heritage and the communities related to it are being systematically destroyed in the historic centres of Pakistan cities and towns.

The new architecture, both for buildings and for conservation, is climatically unsuitable, aesthetically of poor quality and lacks social responsiveness.

Small and medium cities lack cultural, recreation and entertainment facilities and for that reason do not correspond to the changing life styles of the urbanites. There is a need of investments in these sectors and even if run on commercial basis can become profitable activity. To give a sense of participation as a citizen such like interventions are needed from the state, but the trend is not yet developed to invest in these sectors.

4.9.2 Principles

Education, health, entertainment and recreation must cater to the needs of the younger population to create an inclusive social environment and to promote informed discussion and debate. The Task Force was also cognizant of the connection between human and social values and the built environment and agreed with the opinion that, while humans could influence the built environment, the built environment also influenced humans.

This informed discussion should help create new societal values with the support of appropriately designed physical and social space. Cities and urban areas must be designed to bring meaning to life.

Planning should understand/research and cater to the physical/spatial demands for cultural, recreational, entertainment and educational activities.

Existing cultural events should be studied and better organised for making them available to all classes in the town/city. This should include elite events and culture as well.

Guidelines for an aesthetically pleasing, energy efficient, socially responsive architecture, signage and street furniture should be developed and implemented. The support of academia and professional organisations for this should be sought.

Heritage conservation should integrate into the overall cities/towns planning and development process and the advice of trained conservationalists should be sought to develop relevant principles. Monuments should not be viewed in isolation but in their context, be it a small city or a historic area of a fast growing city.

4.9.3 Facilitation:

It is necessary to identify and remove/modify all laws, regulations and procedures that prevent the promotion of culture, contemporary values and expression of ideas.

Based on a study of demand, space should be allocated for educational/academic, entertainment and recreational activities. Laws to protect land earmarked for these activities should be developed and strictly enforced.

In and around shrines, parks, transport and cargo terminals, sports facilities, hawkers' zones should be developed in an aesthetic and planned manner so as to avoid traffic congestion and enhance the environmental quality of these locations. Space for performers should also be developed in shrines and parks and in pedestrian areas.

In all small towns and in the sub-central district business (CDBs) of the larger cities cultural precincts with pedestrian areas and space for recreational and cultural activity should be developed and cultural events organised in them (such as inviting local musicians and singers to perform, artists to paint wall surfaces, weekly book fairs, well designed spaces for weekly bazaars etc).

The economic opportunity that can be found in catering to the needs of pilgrims to devotees to shrines must be explored. Communities near well-attended shrines can be shown the opportunities in providing some level of services to “shrine tourism”.

City government should create a special fund for support to associations/community groups that promote/support the creation and running of libraries, neighbourhood clubs and sports activities etc. This fund should be generated from the private/corporate sector whose representatives should be on the board of the fund.

Institutional areas exist in most towns and cities of Pakistan. To enhance their environmental quality and social ambience, through traffic in these areas should be curtailed and aesthetically designed pavements, street signage and furniture should be provided. The advice of academia and professional organisations should be sought for this purpose.

The above recommendations would gain support by the preparation of a National Heritage Charter and the development of departments of conservation at the provincial level.

4.10 Housing and Real Estate and its Relationship to Land, Industry and Finance.

4.10.1 Issues

Urban areas are confronted with enormous housing deficit, estimated to be 2.7 to 3 million units (House Building Finance Corporation 2008). The supply side is extremely weak, meeting about one-third of the requirements. Public sector housing schemes are few and take very long to develop. Hence the deficit is aggravating. In the recent floods nearly half a million housing units have been affected in the urban areas making housing situation bad to worst. In addition, the quality of housing is generally poor; 30 per cent of the housing units are old, without permanent roofs and need replacement and improvements. The room occupancy is 3.2 persons (Census 1998), which is twice more congested than the limits prescribed by the UN.



Sialkot



Sukkur

The National Housing Policy 2001 prescribed the role of the government as a facilitator in the housing sector. As such the federal and provincial governments have stopped financing the construction of houses for their employees, and instead have been promoting housing schemes on an ownership basis. The recent housing initiatives launched under the Prime Minister’s Program target only the low income groups.

The proportion of rental housing in urban areas was around 22 per cent in 1998 (census 1998). It is estimated that demand for rental housing is increasing at a rate of 8 percent per year. To respond to such a huge demand, there are a few rental housing projects launched and that too, in large cities like Karachi. The tenant-favouring Rent Restriction Laws are a major hurdle in the growth of the rental housing projects.

Non-availability of serviced land is the principal constraint for housing. Urban land markets suffer two problems; one enough agriculture land is not being converted for housing needs and secondly the available land is being used for un-economical low density housing.

The housing finance level in the country is as low as 1 percent of GDP as compared to 10 to 15 percent in other developing countries (McKinsey 2009). The traditional source of housing finance has mainly been the House Building Finance Corporation (HBFC) whose disbursements are inadequate as compared to an annual demand of approximately Rs 8 billion. Meanwhile, the private banks have expanded their involvement in housing finance in recent years, and have captured about 67 per cent share of the total disbursed amount but they are serving only the needs of middle or higher income groups.

Vague land titles, unclear property tax and other related laws, lack of transparency in allotment of land in public sector schemes and un-regulated activities of private housing societies / developers are other factors contributing towards increasing housing shortage.

A large number of katchi abadis have sprung up in all the major cities as a result of available housing going beyond the affordable level of most of the urban population. It is estimated that 40 to 45 per cent of population is living in these katchi abadis in major cities.

4.10.2 Principle and Facilitations

Housing sector has a great potential for generating employment opportunities and expanding industry and trade activities and may be instrumental in seeking economic recovery.

- **Enabling Role of the Government:**

In the previous policies housing has been regarded as a fixed commodity or product. Accordingly, the targets and achievements are determined in terms of number of housing schemes completed and housing units built. In fact housing is a process which is continuous in nature and driven by ever expanding housing demand / needs and keeps on evolving with socio-economic changes in the urban society and technological advancement in the country. It is this normal process of housing that should be supported and promoted by the government rather than indulging itself in development of housing schemes and construction of housing units which activity should be left to individuals, communities and private developers and realtors. However, to support the process that is evolving a proper understanding of the process, its actors and factors has to be established and understood at the micro level otherwise facilitation attempts, as in the past, will not succeed.

Government's role in supporting and promoting the housing process may be in assuring availability of properly serviced housing sites, access to housing finance and building technology including appropriate design and construction services, provision of urban utilities

and services, supportive zoning and building regulations and relaxed taxation and rental restrictions. In this regard following facilitations would be pertinent:

- Undertaking land and housing appraisal at the district level to act as the baseline inventory of housing situation,
 - Establishing Housing Price Index (HPI) and Housing Access Index (HAI) with the assistance of Federal Bureau of Statistics,
 - Development of a Housing Resource Centre in each district beginning with major cities such as, Karachi, Lahore and Rawalpindi / Islamabad,
 - Re-vitalizing HBFC by encouraging it to venture into new avenues such as community mortgage programmes, housing credit assistance to public and corporate organization employees, support to bankable housing projects in the private sector and options of drawing funds from the public through permissible financial channels,
 - Relaxation of laws, byelaws, zoning rules and regulations relevant to housing including FAR for house building projects that aim to target urban poor; initiation of Transferable Development Rights (TDR); revision of urban housing density standards in existing neighborhoods; and initiation of urban re-development on the pattern of high density and mixed land use and revitalization proposed above and already launched in many low income schemes, and
- The Real Estate Market Approach:

Urban real estate must be recognized as an important capital asset that needs to be allowed to circulate through the economy in order to stimulate the same. Real estate in urban areas is often “locked” in that it’s free circulation through the economy is restricted. As a result, existing land use in urban areas is often in contrast to the needs and demand of residents and users. Such “locking up” of capital is attributable, among other things, to (i) an outdated regime of property rights that frequently produces unclear title and which possesses a long drawn process of redress, benefits and exemptions afforded to urban elites that encourage the maintenance of the status quo and discourage equitable and economically rational urban development, (ii) a system of inheritance that renders easy and secure transfer of title difficult (iii) a system of property tax and rent restriction legislation that does not provide incentives to the redevelopment of congested areas or city centers and, instead provide incentives to the continuation of the status quo. Steps must be taken to remove impediments in the free and secure transfer of title and, at the same time, the benefits and exemptions conferred on urban elites must be rolled back (specifically, the exemption from property tax enjoyed by land owned by the provincial governments must be withdrawn).

The real estate investment vehicles like the real estate investment trusts introduced over the past several years have not met with success. Their lack of success is as much to do with an unregulated property market, the inefficient system of title registration and property transfer as it does with lack of understanding and awareness of the potential of such vehicles.

At the same time, the high demand for urban housing has witnessed the repeated use of the Land Acquisition Act, 1984 for the purposes of providing land to private housing schemes. The question of whether the exercise of eminent domain in this fashion constitutes a “public purpose” as envisioned by the Constitution needs to be publicly debated. The use of the Land Acquisition Act, 1894 for housing must be brought to an end. (More than any other single measure, this will considerably reduce the outward and automobile dependent sprawl of urban areas.)

- Measure to Meet Housing Needs of the Poor

Low income housing should consist of 60 square metre plots, long and narrow: width to depth ratio 1:3, with permission to build ground plus 2-1/2 floors. The built-up area of the plots should be a minimum of 65 per cent and a density of 2,000 to 2,500 persons per hectare may be achieved. Non-polluting commercial activity which does not generate heavy traffic may be permitted in the homes. Planning should create independent neighbourhoods around open spaces rather than along streets. Each neighbourhood should not exceed 300 households. These steps will lower land per unit costs, reduce infrastructure capital costs, increase densities and provide a better social environment.

It is important that the cost of low income housing should be brought down to what poor households can pay over a 15 year period. Over and above that, the cost should be subsidized. To lower costs further, core housing can be provided which can be increased incrementally by the owners. Alternatively, houses and/or apartments can be built which are finished externally and with properly completed water use areas. The rest of the house (plastering, flooring, painting, internal doors and windows) can be left to the owners. However, to make this successful, strictly enforced rules and regulations for proper targeting and prevention of speculation for a period of 15 years need to be developed. Cross subsidizing low income housing from high income commercial and residential development should also be initiated.

Location for low income housing should be within the city and for that incentives should be given to developers. These can be market oriented such as much higher FAR for lower income groups and/or transfer of FAR benefits from one area to another.

The cut-off date for all *katchi abadis* except where land is required for infrastructure purposes should be made rational and enforceable. For relocation of affected *katchi abadi* dwellers, land should be allocated as near as possible to their original locations. To make this financially viable, a process of land sharing with developers and/or NGOs can be initiated on the pattern of the CODI and/or SPARC initiated programmes in Bangkok and Bombay. “*Katchi abadi* improvement and regularisation” should now move from provision of infrastructure to improving liveability. This can be done by making these settlements more aesthetic and by creating attractive community spaces and infrastructure for economic and social activity and improving the existing ones.

- High Density Mixed Housing Development

Apartments for lower middle and middle income groups should have no restriction on height and should have a minimum density of 2,000 persons per hectare. However, proper standards

for the maintenance of lifts and fire fighting will have to be developed and enforced. To this end, the need for a “condominium law” highlighted above is reiterated.

All commercial and office complexes should be mixed use with 30 per cent of the floor area reserved for residential and recreational purposes. Regulations for such areas should be developed as a result of an urban design exercise specific to the area in which such complexes are to be located. The urban design exercise would develop recommendations for infrastructure, density, traffic and transport related issues. Densities can be increased to over 4,000 persons per hectare provided adequate transport, traffic management and other infrastructure facilities can be developed.

No development scheme should have plots of over 400 square metres. If such plots are created then they should be heavily taxed to discourage such developments.

4.11 Urban Transport

4.11.1 Issues

Urban transport is a key factor in improving liveability conditions and lowering cost of transportation and of doing business in the cities. Faced with numerous problems the sector is stated to be in a state of chaos. Briefly, the main issues are;

- Travelling between and within cities have increased manifold due to growth of population, increased economic activities and low density haphazard sprawl segregating homes from places of work
- A phenomenal growth of motor vehicles beyond carrying capacity of the urban road systems. A striking feature is the increasing proportion of motor cycles (59 per cent of the total motor vehicles)
- The quality and quantity of public bus services has deteriorated since deregulation and increasing fares, the predominant mean of transport now is private vehicles (about 82 per cent)
- In-appropriate land use policies, mixed local and through traffic, road encroachments and use of poor quality fuel have aggravated congestion, delays and air pollution.
- Grandiose road building works take precedence over simpler traffic management solutions and, over and above being inequitable allocations of public funds, often create more problems than resolving them, and
- Inter city transport (goods and passenger) is overtaken by exceedingly costly and less efficient road transport than the railways.

4.11.2 Principles

- The provision of public transport must be equated to the right of mobility and the non-availability of public transport or adequate public transport options must be understood to be a violation of Fundamental Rights
- There should be coordination and harmony between land use planning, transport planning and traffic management with new urban development to be allowed without a corresponding understand of the demands it will make on existing transport infrastructure.
- Use of “Green Transport” and zero energy means (walking and cycling)
- Private sector owned and operated transport system with strong public sector regulatory and legal control
- Subsidizing public transport fares for urban poor.

4.11.3 Facilitations

Bus Rapid Transport options must be considered on account of their cost and the flexibility they provide in selecting and changing routes.



CNG Bus Project, Karachi

Due to an absence of affordable, flexible and comfortable transport, the number of motorbikes as an option is on the increase in Pakistan. Surveys tend to show that people prefer motorbikes to buses. The number of motorbikes, for example, in Karachi, has doubled in the last six years. The only problem with the promotion of motorbike use is that women do not drive motorbikes in Pakistan. This restriction can be overcome by the promotion of new societal values. There is a need to promote environmentally-friendly motorbikes and to cater to their traffic and parking related issues.

Traffic has become the major problem, not only in large cities, but also in the intermediate and medium towns such as Sukkur, Gujranwala, Mingora etc. To overcome this problem, it is

necessary to segregate local and through traffic, not through building bypasses alone, but by creating one-way systems and protecting institutional and cultural areas from through traffic.

The other issue is the segregation of traffic and pedestrian movement. For this proper pedestrian friendly footpaths are required and car and motorcycle parking arrangements as well. To overcome this problem, space for and the location and possibility of expansion for storage, warehousing, cargo handling and related facilities become important. However, public money should not be employed in building parking infrastructure for the benefit of private automobile owners. Instead, local governments should be encouraged to raise parking fees and promote taxi services.

4.12 Environment

4.12.1 Issues

Increasing Urbanization accompanied by economic growth under “growth first” strategy has placed urban environment – both built and natural, under tremendous stress. The growing degradation has adversely affected all environmental elements such as; air, water, noise levels, sanitation, aesthetics and ecology. Human and nature have been affected in many ways. For example, health and safety has been threatened by air pollution – ambient as well as indoor, water pollution and in-adequate sanitation and drainage arrangements. Traffic congestion and water pollution has impacted urban economy and competitiveness. The level of urban amenity has scaled down due to air and water pollution, traffic congestion and unsanitary conditions. Diminishing agricultural land, loss of trees and green cover and rampant encroachment on natural assets i.e., rivers, lakes, sea fronts and wood land, have caused irreversible loss to ecology.

A large number of poor people residing in slums, katchi abadis and sub-standard *Nai abadis* who do not have adequate access to clean water, sewage collection, waste disposal, safe household fuel, decent housing and health care facilities are worst prey of environmental deterioration.

Improving life style, growth-first economic strategy and subsidized energy pricing have led to over use of energy resources in urban areas. Cities are now responsible for bulk of carbon gas releases in the atmosphere and rise in atmospheric warming.

Lack of effective application of environmental management techniques e.g., Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and (NEQs) and deficiencies in the institutional and legal structures as envisioned under National Environment Policy 2006 the cities have become “heavens of pollution”. On the one hand the polluters don’t pay for the pollution they spread and on the other hand public investment tend to support their economic activities than to clean their polluting consequences.

4.12.2 Principles and Facilitations

- Investing in Health Care

This would entail to substantially increase in public funding in water and sanitation sectors and in the preventive and primary health care. This would also involve mobilizing public awareness against pollution and seeking their participation to control it.

- Full Cost Recovery of Energy and Other Utility Services:

Measures in this regard are necessary to stop over use and wastage of precious natural resources. Foremost measures include; firstly to establish correct and non-subsidized prices at national level and secondly to enhance level of cost recovery at the local levels.

- Integrating Environmental Considerations in Urban Development Plans

This would not only mean to incorporate environmental information, prevalent environmental policies, rules, regulations, EIA requirements in the development plans but also subjecting urban development plans to detailed environment impact assessment including the public hearing and scrutiny. The present practice of carrying out cursory environmental appraisal of development projects at the Planning Commission has assumed a routine exercise.

- Pursuing objectives of the “Green City” initiative

Measures such as the following will be need to be undertaken:

- Making buildings more energy efficient by reducing the use of air-conditioners in the summer and promoting solar water heaters in the winter.
- Putting in place CNG buses and mass transit systems in major cities to meet the mobility needs of the public and to reduce pollution caused by private vehicles.
- Promoting compact, high density, mixed land use urban pattern, which is less automobile dependant, less expensive to serve with infrastructure and puts less pressure on surrounding green areas and other natural assets.
- Creating urban eco-system by following practices such as the promotion of kitchen gardens, reuse and recycling of waste and creating livelihood close to residents, rain harvesting, protection of gardens, parks, open spaces and green areas and the creation of proper pathways for pedestrians and cyclists etc.
- Preparation of environment management plan of towns and cities (covering DRR concerns as well) and mandatory environment impact assessment of all urban development projects
- Pursuing objectives of the “Green City” initiative of Ministry of Environment as part of the UN Green Cities Declaration and Urban Environment Accord 2006.

4.13 Urban Security

4.13.1 Issues

Human security in urban areas has worsened. This is due to break down in law and order as well as a result of societal transformation from caste based to class based structures. This situation has been complicated due to the rent seeking urban elite and status seeking conservatives, who have forcefully denied emergence of popular and regional institutions especially cultural and political, and withheld the majority from enjoying human rights and liberties. Subsequently, legislation and implementation of new laws suffered leading to administration failure. Attempts at denying of voting rights to women and financial autonomy to local government, misuse of blasphemy laws, and not bringing about reforms in police and bureaucracy are examples.

Pakistan's patriarchal leadership is challenged by the young and women. This is a major cause of domestic violence and strife including gender violence.

There is a direct conflict between the aggressively upwardly mobile lower middle class and the entrenched rent seeking rich, which to a very large extent is manifest in manipulation of the land market and in labour market manipulation.

In response to governance failure, interest groups, mafia and sectarian groups have emerged and made hostage majority of the people who have little or no resort to formal sector protection and services. The infighting among these groups over turf rights, extortions, etc is major cause of security concerns.

International movements like Al-Qaeda, Taliban, etc and strategic movements to secure international trade and capture local resources and markets clash and compete with each other in Pakistan. They fragment society, cause internal conflicts and encourage violence and disturbances.

Clan and ethnic relationships in most cases provide linkages with government institutions and political parties. This prevents the development of a truly democratic society and it also supports the development of vigilantes and gangs. It is common that young people are implicated in false cases and gang leaders bail them out and make them participate in gang activities.

4.13.2 Principles and Facilitation

Security of life and property is one of the most basic functions of the state. This security is also related to prevention of accident through any form (fire, disaster, building collapse, terrorism etc.). Such security can only be provided by a responsive governance system and efficient and accountable line departments. The creation of such a governance system and line departments cannot take place without political will and the creation of required and trained manpower, leadership and a knowledge of the problems the people of Pakistan face in their daily lives.

Security that is being provided to the officials of Pakistan's establishment is causing immense hardship to urban dwellers. It is affecting their livelihoods and health-care systems and its efficiency is often questioned by those providing this security. These security arrangements

should be reviewed so as to minimize the socio-economic disruption that the current procedures are creating.

Lastly, the Task Force is not unaware of the increasing anecdotal accounts linking a militant world-view with existing conditions in urban areas. With cities dirty and exclusionary, it is difficult to breed healthy human spirits. Once again, the refrain that cities should be designed to improve the human spirit is reiterated.

5 GENERAL CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Task Force is aware that urban planning and development are primarily dealt by the provincial and local governments and, hence, they are the principal audience of this report. However the Federal government considers itself as vested with an advisory role over provincial and local governments to prepare and implement city specific development strategies to cope with growing urban problems and to coordinate at the federal level the development of intercity and ecology related trunk infrastructure that supports urban development. Of course, the Federal Government also has an interest in the planning, development and management of cities on account of the contribution of urban areas to the national economy.

In light of the above, the Federal Government also has the responsibility stimulate the debate and discussion necessary to create consensus amongst provincial governments towards producing cohesive strategy towards urban planning and development.

It is pointed out that the recommendations of the Working Group on Urban Development, in its Report of May 2010, have been incorporated into this Report. Finally, the overarching and holistic recommendations of the Task Force on Urban Development are as under:

1. Recognition of the role and importance of urbanism in the development of the national economy, culture and society

Because of the population explosion and rapid rural to urban migration and because urban areas are home to majority economic and industrial output of the country, the importance of understanding the role of urban areas must be appreciated. To this end, stakeholders must approach everything from urban policies to the legal and regulatory framework for providing urban services with an appreciation of the gradual centralization of urbanism in the national narrative. Cities and urban areas must not be thought of as places of commerce and industry alone, but also as hubs of human interaction, a vibrant and safe society and culture.

2. Formalization and regulation of urban property markets

In order to raise the standards practiced in the real-estate market and in order to bring some transparency into real-estate transactions, a national real-estate developers association should be promoted with the power to set and maintain professional standards. Real-estate practitioners should be qualified and the body so promoted should have the power to set qualifications and the curriculum for their dissemination. Quality

control among real-estate developers and practitioners will bring much needed transparency into the real-estate market and will be step towards developing a proper real-estate market in Pakistan. It will also bring some rationality into the prices of real-estate. The Task Force realizes that most real-estate transactions are in the informal sector and the above recommendation cannot apply to them immediately. However, once the formal sector regulates its activities, the culture that it develops will have positive effects on informal sector transactions, especially if the other land and housing related recommendations of the Task Force are implemented.

3. Repeal of laws, byelaws and zoning regulations that suppress real estate development

Many urban laws, byelaws, zoning regulations and policies have the effect of locking land and preventing it from entering into the real-estate market. Such laws, byelaws etc. include those that impede the right of the owner of property to develop it in a manner that responds to market demand. Such laws include, at an obvious level, land-use segregation, height restrictions and prescribed set-backs and FARs. At a more subtle level, they include laws, like the West Pakistan Urban Immovable Property Tax Act, 1958, which exempts the Federal and Provincial Government from the payment of property tax. This exemption allows government land to remain underutilized and outside the real-estate market. Such laws, byelaws and exemptions must be revoked and, as much as practicable, laws, byelaws etc. in a city should promote the free and untrammelled transfer of land from one person to another. Moreover, laws, byelaws etc. should do away with rigid land-use classifications and promote, instead, high-density mixed use settlements with high quality public spaces.

Laws and byelaws etc. should also be reviewed to see if they cause distortions in the prices of real-estate. Unregulated “commercialization” spells ruin for property prices in existing commercial areas and allows the owners of residential plots to claim an unearned windfall benefit. Such distortions through unregulated commercialization, in the property market must be put an end to.

4. Promotion of public transport and inner-city connectivity

The increasing populations of urban areas can no longer look to the private automobile as a means of mobility. The latter will do nothing but increase congestion and worsen the state of air quality. Both will spell disaster for the urban and national economies. Nor can governments continue to spend extraordinary sums of money to provide infrastructure to a relatively small urban elite. Urban local governments and provincial governments must invest in public transport over their covert support of automobile infrastructure. Moreover, stakeholders must not forget the axiom that high-density cannot be achieved without adequate public transport infrastructure which requires subsidies both for construction and for operation.

5. Promotion of high-density and mixed use zoning

The essence of cities, in the view of the Task Force, is that they are places where human interaction spurs the economy, innovation and civilization. To this end, laws, byelaws etc. in place in urban areas that promote segregated land use and low density sprawl should be rejected in favour of laws and byelaws that support high density, mixed use, pedestrian friendly urban spaces with abundant recreational spaces. The high density use of land will free up otherwise unavailable real-estate locked into a single-use low-density land use.

6. Ending of use of Land Acquisition Act, 1894 for purposes of housing

The use of eminent domain, ostensibly for the public purpose of providing housing, should be put an end to. It cannot be argued that high-end residential schemes are for a “public purpose” when the only segment of society they cater to are the elite. Moreover, the use of the Land Acquisition Act, 1894 has exacerbated the low-density urban sprawl as the exercise of eminent domain makes cheap agricultural land at the peri-urban areas attractive.

7. Enforcement of city limits

Tying in with the above suggestion, city limits should be clearly demarcated and no additional urban development undertaken outside them except with an Environmental Approval obtained from the Environment Protection Agency concerned of an Environment Impact Assessment of such extended development.

The combined effect of recommendations No. 6 and 7 shall be to end the outward sprawl of urban areas and, in conjunction with a more transparent real-estate market resulting from the implementation of recommendation No. 2, will result in urban development returning to existing areas of the city/urban area – which is where it should be to begin with – and the achievement of high-density urban areas.

8. Promotion of quality public spaces

Tied into the importance of having a high-density mixed use urban area is the requisite need for high quality public spaces. By this, the Task Force means pedestrian friendly public spaces. The purpose of high quality mixed use public spaces is to promote person-to-person interaction. The social benefits of such inclusionary and equitable development are immeasurable. Also, urban planning should view cities as places that provide meaning to life and public architecture should, as much as practicable, strive towards this goal.

9. Housing for low and lower middle income groups

The Task Force recognizes that vibrant, secure and economically prosperous urbanization cannot take place without adequate, affordable and appropriately located housing for low and lower middle income groups and supporting social sector infrastructure. The

recommendations, both market related and subsidized, recommended in this report should be a priority.

Task Force on Urban Development, Planning Commission, Islamabad

TO BE PUBLISHED IN THE GAZETTE OF PAKISTAN EXTRAORDINARY

GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN
PLANNING COMMISSION
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DIVISION

Islamabad, the 28th June, 2010

NOTIFICATION

No. 1(183)Admn-VI/PC/2008. The Deputy Chairman, Planning Commission has been pleased to constitute a Task Force on "Urban Development" with the following composition:

- | | | |
|----|--|----------------------|
| 1. | Mr. Arif Hasan
37-D, Mohammad Ali Society
Karachi | Chairman |
| 2. | Mr. Ahmed Rafay Alam
Advocate High Court
1-Bawa Park, Upper Mall
Lahore. | Member |
| 3. | Mr. Shahid Kardar
46-B, Gulberg-III
Lahore | Member |
| 4. | Ms. Nafeesa Shah
Chairperson, NCHD, 14 th - 15 th Floor
Shaheed-e-Millat Secretariat
Islamabad. | Member |
| 5. | Mr. Ghulam Mohy-ud-Din Mari
73-D, Block-4, Satellite Town
Quetta. | Member |
| 6. | Dr. Noman Ahmed,
Head of the Department of Architecture,
NED University, Karachi. | Member |
| 7. | Arch. Shaukat Ali Sharar
Shaukat Associates
Near Girls College, Saidu Sharif
Swat. | Member |
| 8. | Mr. Maqbool Elahi,
Urban Development Specialist
Planning Commission
Islamabad | Member/
Secretary |

-2-

2. Terms of Reference (TORs) of the above said Task Force are at Annex-I. The Task Force may co-opt by consensus any other member.

(Ayaz Hasan Zuberi)
Section Officer

The Manager
Printing Corporation of Pakistan Press
University Road, Karachi - 5.

Copy to:

1. PSO to Deputy Chairman, Planning Commission, Islamabad
2. PS to Secretary, Planning & Development Division, Islamabad
3. All Members, Planning Commission, Islamabad
4. Chairman/Members of Task Force on Urban Development
5. Additional Secretary, Planning & Development Division, Islamabad
6. Accountant General Pakistan Revenues, Islamabad
7. Project Director (Vision 2030)
8. A.O. (A&B) Section and A.O. (A&F), P&D Division, Islamabad

(Ayaz Hasan Zuberi)
Section Officer

National Task Force on Urban Development Terms of Reference

Planning Commission has established a Task Force on Urban Development to devise a consensus urban reform agenda and list of priority projects, whose implementation in the coming years shall ensure realization of the following national objectives:

- Cities to become strong; liveable, prosperous and functional in all dimensions-physical, social, economic and improved governance.
- Cities to become competitive and perform their historic role as engine of economic growth.
- Develop quality infrastructure that supports urban development.
- Review land use, building regulations, governance and planning to see:
 - how competitive cities are
 - how compatible they are with growth
 - how attractive they are for investment
 - how inclusive they are
- Cities to be well managed and governed with empowered institutions to enhance business, community and knowledge.
- Creation of new knowledge to understand and resolve urban issues.
- Other national objectives.

The Task Force will also review available analytical work on urban development sector for Pakistan, including the work done by the “working group on urban development” constituted by the Planning Commission for the preparation of 10th Five Year Plan.