Karachi Demolition 2018
Destroys livelihood and
renders thousands jobless
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>City and plans</td>
<td>Arif Hasan</td>
<td>02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-encroachment drive destroys livelihoods Market and the Sindh government</td>
<td>Aamir Latif</td>
<td>03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evictions: by-product of urban policy failure</td>
<td>Nasir Jamal</td>
<td>05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Platitudes overshadow consequences of Karachi anti-encroachment drive</td>
<td>Afshan Subohi</td>
<td>06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Empress Dethroned and a Lighthouse in Darkness</td>
<td>News Line Desk</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2,500 Shops demolished in Karachi’s Saddar area: KMC Report</td>
<td>Such TV</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lives of the poor</td>
<td>Noman Ahmed</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supreme Court forbids demolition of houses during Karachi anti-encroachment drive</td>
<td>Shafi Baloch</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Umer Farooqi market is no more, but the man lives on in shopkeepers’ hearts</td>
<td>Bilal Farooqi</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil society demands apology and compensation plan</td>
<td>Zia ur Rehman</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil society activists demand restoration of demolished shops</td>
<td>Tribune Desk</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-encroachment drive: Govt asked to take experts, affected people on board on rehabilitation plan</td>
<td>Dawn Desk</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dispossession of the poor</td>
<td>Foqia Sadiq Khan</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Appendix: 1
- Photos of the demolition

### Appendix: 2
- Karachi Eviction 2018: Video Footages and Video Links

---

**Urban Resource Centre**

A-2, 2nd Floor, Westland Trade Centre, Commercial Area, Block 7 & 8, Shaheed-e-Millat Road, Karachi, Pakistan. Tel: +92 21 34387692, E-mail: urc@cyber.net.pk, Website: www.urckarachi.org FB: http://www.facebook.com/URCKHI
The recent demolitions of formal and informal businesses in Karachi have raised some important questions. What is a city? What are encroachments? What is culture and heritage and law?

The city is where people live, work, come to study, trade and fulfil their dreams. These activities require wholesale markets which we did not provide, and so they expanded in the old city and destroyed almost all our built heritage. They required cargo terminals which we also did not provide so they developed wherever there was space without workers’ homes, toilets, and other social requirements, causing not only social problems but also immense problems for heavy vehicles exiting the city.

We have not provided bus terminals, depots, and workshops, and so by paying bhatta they have established themselves on the roads of the city creating unbearable congestion. We were unable to provide affordable and accessible housing to our working class so they live in katchi abadis in perpetual insecurity without access to proper education, health, family planning, and jobs.

People work and at lunchtime they need places to eat cheaply. Formally, these do not exist so pavement restaurants and hawkers develop to cater to their needs. The working classes have a desperate need for cheap bazaars but there are no spaces for them, so they occupy the pavements of the city. All that we were unable to give to the city, and which the city has acquired itself out of necessity, is known as encroachments. Heritage is not just buildings. It is much more than that.

However, we have developed huge housing societies with lots of big plots for the elite and the middle classes of this country but here too we were not able to provide sufficient space for entertainment, recreation, health and education facilities. So today, they function out of houses and commercial areas not meant for them. These are also encroachments.

Heritage is not just buildings. It is much more than that — it is living tradition which is added to as the city evolves and which is related to the history of the neighbourhood in which the buildings are located. It is nihari, sajjji, Baloch ice cream, Ghaseetay Khan Ka Haleem and public spaces to have them at an affordable cost. Such spaces too, we have not provided.

In the narrow lanes of Karachi’s settlements, young people create libraries, arrange mushairas, qawwals, variety programmes, practice the musical instruments that they have secretly learned to use, and young singers desperately try to find a place in the world of music. There are no spaces for them to learn, practise, develop and perform. As such, many aspiring artists fail to fulfil their dreams. We have never thought of these issues or of multi-class spaces where popular culture can evolve and take root. And then there are no places where we can protest against the real or conceived tyranny of the state, international events and social customs and biases.

Cities are living entities. They do not wait for formal plans to acquire what they need. True, they acquire it in an ad hoc manner, shaped by the limitations of the financial and planning capabilities and capacities of their informal planners. And if the planning does not accommodate and support this informal process, the city bursts and eats up that which was formally planned.
But why did Karachi’s planners and politicians not plan for all that was required? One of the possible reasons was an absence of anthropological research on socioeconomic relations which did not feed into the planning process. As such, the planners were unable to understand the social dynamics of the city. The other aspect is related to the fact that the planners and the politicians were more interested in the form of the city than aspects of livability, the product of class biases in their education and society. The development of large-scale industrial estates was undertaken, but again, in most cases, without space for workers’ homes, and the informal support facilities that they required.

Architects are supposed to be the conscience of society for the development of a humane city. However, Karachi’s architects have sought patronage from the rich and the powerful and catered to their needs. With the exception of a few, they have not worked or lobbied towards accommodating in a humane manner the needs of an evolving city. Hopefully, as a result of the demolitions that have taken place, they will come closer to the ethics of their profession and try and integrate the needs of Karachi’s citizens into the larger planning process.

As far as law is concerned, there should always be a possibility to appeal against its procedural aspects so as to protect the functions the city has acquired out of necessity in the absence of planning or official indifference and corruption.

(By Arif Hasan, Dawn, 10 December 2018)

**Anti-encroachment drive destroys livelihoods**

Drive to vacate illegally occupied state land renders thousands jobless, homeless

Aamir Latif

Until a few weeks ago, Karachi’s historic Empress Market was home to hundreds of kiosks selling fruits, vegetables and daily-use items. Pedestrians, vehicles, buyers and sellers fought for space.

But a recent government drive against encroachment in the city has razed hundreds of shops to the ground rendering thousands unemployed.
The top court last month ordered the government of southern Sindh province, of which Karachi is the capital, to demolish illegal structures and bring the metropolis back to its “original shape”.

Following court orders, markets, shops and stalls built on government lands were flattened.

Things are likely to deteriorate as the ill-planned drive is expected to target more “illegally built” houses, mainly in low-income areas.

The city government two weeks ago demolished hundreds of small to medium houses in Mehran Town -- a low-end locality in Karachi’s eastern outskirts -- declaring them illegal even though residents insisted they had bought the units through real estate brokers.

“I cried and begged. I showed them documents to prove that I have bought this house. But they did not listen to me and demolished my house,” said Nazeeran Bibi, who works as a domestic maid, trying to fight back her tears.

Angry residents later charred the offices of five real estate agents, who according to them, had brokered their buying deals.

**Old businesses hit hard**
A visit to Saddar area, the city’s commercial hub, shows the extent of disruption the ongoing drive has caused to small-and-medium businesses.

“Our family had been running eight shops here [in Empress Market] since 1986. There was nothing illegal. We have all allotment orders issued by the Karachi Metropolitan Corporation," said Mohammad Idrees, one of the affected shopkeepers.

“This has caused us a loss of over 100 million rupees ($800,000),” he said, adding that his family and 40 employees are now on the streets.

Traders associations complain that shopkeepers were not even given time to relocate their stock, adding that officials involved in selling government land to citizens should be brought to task.

Since mid-November nearly 4,000 shops have been demolished, according to government statistics, depriving an estimated 20,000 workers of their livelihoods.

"Many areas now look like Beirut," said Mehmood Hamid, chairman of a traders’ association, referring to a popular terminology coined to highlight the level of destruction in line with that of the civil war in Lebanon in 1980s.

**Unplanned urbanization**
Analysts warn that if immediate business and livelihood alternatives are not provided the anti-encroachment drive will exacerbate the already grinding unemployment.

"No doubt, the state must discourage land grabbing and illegal constructions. But there must have been a proper follow-up plan to resettle the affected businessmen and common citizens because they had been living and running businesses there for decades under the government’s nose,” Abdul Khalique Ali, a Karachi-based political and social analyst, told Anadolu Agency.

“Leaving such a huge number of people homeless and jobless will not only increase the crime rate but also stoke several other social and psychological issues in the society, including suicide,” he said.

Arif Hassan, a renowned architect sees unplanned urbanization and government’s failure to provide affordable and accessible housing to the citizens, behind direct or indirect encroachments.
"The working class have a desperate need for cheap bazaars but there is no space for them. So, they occupy the pavements of the city. We have developed a lot of housing societies with huge plots for the elite and the middle classes but here too we were not able to provide sufficient space for entertainment, recreation, health and education," Hassan wrote in his column published in local English daily Dawn on Monday.

“All that we were unable to give to the city, and which the city has acquired itself out of necessity, is known as encroachments,” he added.

Mounting criticism has forced the provincial government to file a review petition in the top court.

"We have launched the drive on the Supreme Court's orders. But wherever citizens and businessmen are genuinely harmed, they will be compensated,” Saeed Ghani, provincial minister for local bodies, told reporters.

(By Aamir Latif, World Life Asia Pacific)

Evictions: by-product of urban policy failure
Nasir Jamal

THE ongoing campaign against encroachments in Punjab has surprisingly attracted only muted public censure. While the officialdom customarily looks at the drive as a set of mere statistics — how many structures demolished, and quantity and price of real estate 'freed' from illegal occupation — a large majority of the people have also largely disregarded its 'anti-poor bias'.

In Lahore, for example, the city administration says it has recovered almost 870 acres of illegally occupied state land worth Rs22 billion, and knocked down 7,551 structures and 2,214 temporary encroachments since Oct 2. But it has no record of how many low-income or poor families lost the roof over their heads or their livelihoods because of the drive.

The human impact of the drive is never documented because the families evicted from their homes and micro-businesses bulldozed in the last couple months are not a priority for the ruling elite. Nor is a distinction made by the administration — and even by people at large — between the powerful land mafias and the needy who encroach upon public or private property to shelter their families or feed them.

Little wonder then that the government has no plan to resettle the affected households or compensate poor vendors for their losses and people haven’t reacted strongly enough against recent evictions in the name of the anti-encroachment drive.

The former Planning Commission of Pakistan deputy chairman Dr Nadeemul Haq, who has long been a vocal critic of a strong anti-poor bias in the country’s urban development and policymaking, terms the whole exercise as targeted against poor people. “Don’t (the bureaucrats) notice encroachment (of the state and private property) by the influential and the wealthy? Why can’t no one see the large structures raised and streets closed by the bureaucracy and affluent people (in the name of security)?,” he asks.

Pakistan like many underdeveloped and developing countries, has a long history of powerful mafias illegally occupying state and private property, particularly in urban areas, with the connivance of police, bureaucracy and politicians for resale or for real estate development. (In certain cases, as pointed by Dr Haq, the state itself encroaches upon open spaces like parks and roads earlier marked for public use in the name of development or security.)
But most urban planners warn policymakers against likening such mafias with cases in which low-income and poor people ‘encroach’ upon public or private land because of their housing and occupational needs.

Such ‘encroachers’ may occupy a property for periods ranging between just a few weeks to several years until they move to another place voluntarily or get evicted by the owners with or without the use of force. Growing urban slums and shanties, and roadside vendors and hawkers, they point out, are classic examples showing how the urban poor meet their housing and livelihood requirements by encroaching on available spaces.

Gulzar Haider, the dean of architecture at the Beaconhouse National University in Lahore, argued that protection of the people’s right to shelter and livelihood should always be a priority for a government. “Nothing is more inhuman than taking away shelter from the poor and vulnerable, and trashing their livelihoods. It is the state’s responsibility to provide the affected families alternate housing and compensate them for their business losses.”

Apart from social and economic reasons that lead to temporary encroachments, experts blame weak governance, lack of political will, poor implementation of building laws, delays by the judiciary in adjudication of cases and lack of punitive action against encroachers for rising cases of permanent illegal occupation of the state and private real estate by land mafias.

“(Encroachments, permanent or temporary) represent a complete breakdown of urban governance and planning,” insisted leading architect Kamil Khan Mumtaz. “If we had a strong local government in place we wouldn’t be witnessing this situation today.”

Dr Haq agrees. “Encroachments are essentially a by-product of urban policy’s focus on housing for the rich at the expense of the economic, educational, recreational, health, livelihood and other needs of the common people.”

Mr Haider said the problem of land grabbing could not be addressed without proper implementation of the law, punitive action against powerful mafias, strong surveillance system at the local level and public support. “The needs of the poor to low-income (temporary) encroachers can be dealt only through implementation of an equitable approach towards organised and inclusive urban development and planning. It is time our urban planners start looking beyond the housing and shopping needs of the affluent classes alone. The economic, social and other needs of the poorer segments of the population also require their attention and incorporation in urban development policy.”

Unless the government realises that the poor also need a place to live and earn their livelihood, and make their requirements a part of urban planning, it’ll never be able to control encroachment. The people uprooted from one place today will be compelled to find another tomorrow to encroach.

(By Nasir Jamal, Dawn, The Business and Finance Weekly, 10 December 2018)

Platitudes overshadow consequences of Karachi anti-encroachment drive
Afshan Subohi

THE administrative machinery was galvanized by the apex court’s order to dismantle and demolish illegal structures in Karachi. In the absence of a proper follow-up plan, the anti-encroachment drive dealt a jarring blow to businesses in the old city bazaars.

Whatever the intent, the campaign ended up disrupting the commodity supply chain and tearing apart the social fabric of the affected localities, exposing the nexus that perpetuated the mindless intrusion of the public space before patrons, on court instructions, started to destroy the structures build under their watch.
According to estimates based on information accessed from multiple sources, 3,575 shops have so far been demolished, directly affecting no less than 17,500 workers, if we assume on an average five people tied to each shop. The number of affected people soars to 140,000 on the assumption that each worker has seven dependents.

The absence of a clearly defined administrative hierarchy responsible for managing the megacity and the lack of a workable development plan that matches growing needs leaves the city with insufficient, inefficient basic services and people with no option but to fend for themselves.

“The existence of parallel and often overlapping domains of administrative bodies such as the Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC), Karachi Development Authority, Cantonment Board, Sindh Building Control Authority, Defence Housing Authority, Water Commission, Commissioner’s office, etc generate a perfect scenario where each entity skirts the burden of responsibility on others for all that is wrong while being quick to lay claim to anything positive,” commented Dr Noman Ahmed, dean architecture faculty, NED University who did not find the anti-encroachment drive fair and just.

The worst hit in the exercise so far have been the pool of several thousand workers whose livelihood vanished with the levelled markets.

Some ideas have been floated by independent developers but an alternate plan, oriented to better serve the residents of Karachi, has yet to be worked out by experts who care for the city and its future.

The collective (public and private) financial cost of the anti-encroachment drive appears to be high, though working out the exact quantum was not possible as the campaign is still in progress. The informal nature of the businesses affected, dealing mostly in cash, also blurred the money trail.

It is intriguing, however, that despite the scale of the operation, none of government departments or the relevant provincial ministry, has initiated an exercise to gauge the financial and social cost in a systematic manner.

The business team of Dawn did make an attempt to quantify the cost of the major disruption in the city but did not succeed as the private sector was not forthcoming in sharing the actual monetary details backed with documentary proof.

The cost to the municipal body in terms of rent collected from shops in multiple demolished markets is meagre but the loss to the private sector, according to their claims, runs in hundreds of millions. It includes losses incurred by suppliers and wholesalers, contractors of services and transporters.

The worst hit in the exercise so far have been the pool of several thousand workers whose livelihood vanished with the levelled markets. Many still turn up at the site of the demolished bazaar each day like regular visitors in a graveyard. Many shop owners, however, are said to be negotiating with the government for an alternate site to start afresh.

The mayhem, created by the activity with gigantic earth-moving machinery and huge dumpers clearing debris, has affected the flow of customers even in regular markets in the old city area.

“The informal nature of bazaars, their operators and scores of support services that sustain the activity on a massive scale, makes projecting the public and private financial loss next to impossible. If someone is to quantify the loss to business since the drive started last month it would easily run in billions of rupees,” commented Rafique Jadoon, a leader of traders at the Bolton Market.

Saeed Ghani the provincial minister of local bodies and Katchi Abadis (illegal townships), Wasim Akhtar the Mayor of Karachi and Iftikhar Ali Shallwani the Commissioner Karachi, separately confirmed to Dawn...
that some proposals to adjust the evicted shopkeepers at alternate sites are under consideration but they have not initiated any exercise to calculate the collective cost of the drive.

Wasim Akhtar, explaining the background and the progress of the drive to the Dawn team in his office mentioned limitations posed by the low budget for the gigantic task the mayor’s office has been entrusted with. He mentioned several services where he was forced to depend on financial help from his personal contacts.

Responding to a question on the presence of Bahria Town equipment and loaders on the sites of the drive he informed that it had been requisitioned by him.

“After the court order I was caught in a very difficult situation as the KMC lacked resources and required earth-moving machinery. With the pressure of a close deadline mounting (the Supreme Court gave three weeks time to submit the compliance report) I called up Malik Riaz (the owner of Bahria Town) for help and he obliged. It was all voluntary work on his part. I did not pay a penny, even the bill of diesel used in machinery was paid by him.”

The mayor denied cutting any deal with the property tycoon in exchange for his largesse. “Though I opposed him tooth and nail on the Kothari bypass issue he has always been kind and responded warmly to my calls in times of distress.”

Mr Wasim candidly admitted that all past set-ups including ones dominated by his party did not serve the city well. He mentioned inadequate water, sewage and public transport systems in particular in this regard. “To be fair no one walked the talk for betterment of Karachi. I believe that the PTI government genuinely wants to improve the city and its physical and social infrastructure. Unfortunately they don’t understand the city well enough to actualise their good intentions,” he said.

“Illegal acquisition and trespassing can’t be condoned. We will have to live and work by the law,” the commissioner Karachi opined.

The commissioner assumed charge barely days before the anti-encroachment drive kicked off. He was clearly feeling elated at being part of the team implementing an order that he said had been deferred six times earlier for fear of retaliation.

“There were several instances where lawful tenants encroached upon land around their shops and sublet the place to different parties at a rate of their liking. The shop owners are not poor by any stretch of the imagination.

“Believe it or not many have already set up their shops in better localities like a few pet sellers who have now rented shops near Gizri bridge, a place closer to their customer base in the elite Defense area,” said Mr Shallwani. Mohammad Ali, a shopkeeper based in Empress Market told Dawn that a month before the operation a small shop changed hands for hefty Rs8.5m.

“Plans are afoot to make alternate arrangements for effected shopkeepers,” Mr Shallwani reconfirmed. On the issue of workers rendered unemployed he was not bothered. “God will guide them to earn their living if not here someplace else,” he dismissed concerns in this regard.

Despite the depth, width and the scale of the operation the reaction of the affected people was muted. No riot or violence was reported. The Karachi commissioner believes that ejected shopkeepers know that they have no legal standing and therefore instead of confrontation they have adopted conciliatory stance to make most of an uncomfortable situation.

Saeed Ghani, the relevant minister and an emerging leader of the PPP in Karachi was confident that the relative peace was his doing. “People trust me as a credible person on their side. They know I will not ditch them and try to do all in my power to help them out. I am in touch with all groups, parties and associations,” he said with a smile while narrating anecdotes of the PPP leadership praising him for his performance.
While the affected people approached by the Dawn team raised all kinds of suspicions regarding the drive, all leaders and officials reached insisted that the decision and its implementation has been perfectly even-handed. "It's hard to be convinced unless the biggies also get ejected from ill-gotten land," commented Abdul Rehman another affected shop owner.

If the blueprint for the rehabilitation of the torn-down shops of Empress Market is anything to go by, arithmetic is clearly not a strong suit of the city bureaucracy.

The KMC demolished 3,575 shops in and around Empress Market at the end of October. The drive led to a public outcry, forcing the authorities to pledge that all tenants of the KMC would be resettled in other markets.

According to an official handout, the municipal body has agreed to rehabilitate 1,470 shops in eight of its other markets. As for the rest of the 2,105 shops, the KMC has sought help from the Sindh government to provide space. But the KMC has double-counted as many as 640 shops, casting the mathematics of the entire exercise in doubt.

The handout shows Parking Plaza at Lines Area and the plot in front of it as the KMC's own property that would accommodate 240 and 400 shops, respectively. But the second handout shows the KMC requesting the Sindh chief minister to transfer the same two properties to it, categorising them as the "remaining 2,105 shops required" for rehabilitation.

When contacted by Dawn, the mayor’s office said the ownership status of the two properties is unclear and that's why the chief minister's approval has been sought. It had no answer for why they had been categorised under “remaining shops” except that “auctions at all markets owned by the KMC have been stopped till the affectees have been accommodated on a priority basis” and that “surveys are being conducted”.

(By Afshan Subohi, Dawn, The Business and Finance Weekly, 10 December 2018)
An Empress Dethroned and a Lighthouse in Darkness

I cross the street to my destination with trepidation in the crowded Saddar area of Karachi. It is like I am visiting a friend for the first time after learning that he was in a serious accident. Well, it is a friend but not one of the flesh and blood variety rather of brick and mortar. But it is not an ordinary edifice. It is seeped in a nearly 100 years of history. It is one of the most iconic structures of Karachi. It is the Empress Market.

In 1857 the rebels who rose against the British were tied to the mouth of the canons and blown up at this location. Today the edifice that stands here was meted out the same punishment with no regard for those who sold merchandise here to make a living or for those with tight budgets who shopped here because the prices were good.

I had previously visited the market to photograph it, to show it to visitors to the city and taken school children there who were interested in photography. But things are very different now. From Empress market I proceeded to the Lighthouse area, famous for shoes and second-hand clothing. It was like a war zone. Huge piles of bricks, stone and metal that were once small shops had replaced the lively section known as Landa Bazaar. Still, in the dim streetlight, the buyers and the sellers moved about like apparitions, as the old clothes were laid behind and above the rubble; a proof to the resilience of the vanquished.

But enough said. I will let the pictures plead their own case against the wanton destruction. An inhumane act carried out without sufficient warning and without any attempt at helping in the rehabilitation of those who were robbed of their livelihood. It was, like the song by Bob Marley goes: “Ambush in the Night, Ordered by his Majesty”.

(By Vaqar Ahmed, NewsLine Magazine, 05 December 2018)
https://newslinemagazine.com/an-empress-dethroned-and-a-lighthouse-in-darkness/?fbclid=IwAR0UYLCGvc_hUQSp7JM7JaJRxDJ25NnUbFAWzqBENwu1A74OVp5xW2STNRY

2,500 SHOPS DEMOLISHED IN KARACHI’S SADDAR AREA: KMC REPORT

The Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (KMC) on Saturday sent a report regarding the anti-encroachment operation in the metropolis’ Saddar area to the commissioner and stated that 2,500 shops were razed.

In keeping with the Supreme Court’s directives, KMC prepared a report on the anti-encroachment operation in Karachi’s Saddar and surrounding areas which was conducted from November 5 to 15.

Along with its report, KMC also sent pictures of the area cleared following the drive to the Karachi commissioner.
As per the report, 2,500 illegal shops were razed during the anti-encroachment operation. Six RCC basement and a two-storey building were also demolished to “restore Empress Market”.

“480 illegal shops on Sohrab Khattak Road, 150 encroachments on Sarmad Shaheed Road and 450 stalls at Shahrah-e-Iraq were demolished during the drive,” the report added. It further said that 7,500 sun shades at Akbar Road and surrounding areas were also removed. “Encroachments on Zaibunnisa Street, Magazine Line, Abdullah Haroon Road, Raja Ghazanfar Ali Road and Mir Karam Ali Talpur Road were also removed,” the report read. Further, the report informed that anti-encroachment operations are under way in six other zones of the city.

Karachi Mayor Waseem Akhtar while speaking to media outside an anti-terrorism court said, "We had told the Supreme Court that matters will have to be resolved after taking all stakeholders on-board."

"People are clearing encroachments themselves. Footpaths are for people to walk on and not for stalls but in Karachi people do as they please," he added.

"The Supreme Court had directed that Saddar be cleared of encroachments to set a model. Now, KMC will increase the scope of the anti-encroachment operation," the Karachi mayor added.

Lives of the poor
Noman Ahmed
December 11, 2018

THE past few weeks in Karachi have seen an anti-encroachment drive that has affected livelihoods and living. Those spearheading the drive justify their actions, saying they are legal, and those using the spaces are painted as land grabbers. Meanwhile, another cause for concern is the intended clearing of land along the route of the moribund Karachi Circular Railways.

The underprivileged in Karachi require a comprehensive plan so that they can have a legal right to exist and operate, with the city benefiting from their services.

The foremost issue is land for housing. About half a century ago, land was distributed by city authorities to various categories of urban dwellers according to their need. Land use was determined on the basis of
individual and collective social requirements. Today, land is acquired through clout, capital and clandestine coercion of the institutions concerned.

The poor cannot acquire land through purchase or force as they possess neither surplus capital nor political influence. The state institutions have a responsibility to ensure the poor can access the land market. Existing legal instruments such as the fair implementation of Sindh Katchi Abadis Authority (SKAA) Act, 1987, is an option.

*Karachi’s poor must have the legal right to live and operate.*

This law was promulgated during the tenure of prime minister Mohammad Khan Junejo. The objective of the law was to regularise those squatter settlements which had come up and evolved till March 1985 (revised to June 1997), that existed in ecologically safe locations, had acquired the approval of the land-owning agency/department concerned, and comprised over 40 households. By implementing the law, more than 300 squatter settlements were regularised. The past few years have seen the work of regularisation slowing down due administrative reasons.

As migrations to the city have continued unabated, survey and subsequent regularisation of squatter settlements must be undertaken along scientific lines. With advanced digital mapping tools available, the exercise can be done with greater accuracy.

In the absence of an institutionalised option of accessing shelter, Karachi’s poor developed settlements on left-over and marginal land. An elitist view of such neighbourhoods — referred to as katchi abadis — is that they are breeding grounds and safe havens for criminals and the inhabitants are not deserving of social interaction with the rest. In other words, katchi abadis are looked upon with contempt and as an eyesore. They are viewed as a part of the problem, not the solution.

In fact, katchi abadis are not built with criminal intent, isolated cases notwithstanding. They emerge from unusual sites as there are no alternative locations. When the residents of settlements along the KCR were interviewed recently, they said as much.

The right to run hawker stalls, small- to medium-sized shops and other services also require serious review. The poor do not have the means to purchase or rent shops and commercial spaces that are formally available. But their services and merchandise are needed in shopping areas, transport terminals, business districts, railway stations and traffic junctions.

In many parts of the world, open public spaces are made available to hawkers according to land-utilisation plans. These plans demarcate the limits and conditions within which vending activity is allowed. In India, the Street Vendors Act, 2014, is an important legislative tool that regulates this activity in urban areas. A town-vending committee, with representatives of street hawkers, is constituted to oversee the management of vending activity. Matters relating to space adjustments, vending licences and extortion and bribery are dealt with by the committee. Similar laws and provisions exist in the UK, the US and many other countries.

Sindh can consider introducing an amendment in the existing local government laws to make provisions for vending activity to exist on formal and legal grounds. The affectees of various anti-encroachment operations should be documented and accommodated in formally created places to save them from financial destruction.

The provincial government and KMC must identify locations for setting up temporary bazaars to facilitate vendors and retailers in areas where a greater number of shops and stalls have been razed. The design and construction of stalls should ensure both functionality and aesthetics. Women entrepreneurs and sales staff must be encouraged. The same support should be extended to the disabled.

Image lifting and communication is another strategy that can help in scaling up the operations of such bazaars. Innovative ads and campaigns can be designed to boost commercial potential. Introduction of banking kiosks and provision of credit card facility can enhance the performance of bazaars. Similarly, bazaars can also become tools for stretching target subsidies in underprivileged localities.
Supreme Court forbids demolition of houses during Karachi anti-encroachment drive

The Supreme Court on Tuesday forbade provincial authorities from destroying houses during an ongoing city-wide anti-encroachment drive.

Chief Justice of Pakistan Mian Saqib Nisar was hearing review petitions filed by various parties, including the Sindh government, against the apex court's earlier order on the ongoing anti-encroachment drive in the city at the Karachi Registry.

Sindh Advocate General Sindh Salman Taalibuddin told the bench that the apex court had ordered authorities to clear encroachments situated around Empress Market, adding that there were reservations over the drive extending to other parts of the city. He urged the court to review the order.

"Take a look: What are the consequences of the anti-encroachment drive?"

The chief justice responded that the top court had only ordered city authorities to clear the footpaths and streets around Empress Market, and to make the historic structure "a model for the rest of Karachi".

"The directive to remove encroachments from the footpaths and streets was clear," Justice Nisar said. "We wanted pedestrians to also have some rights while walking on the streets."

"How will people walk on footpaths if they are taken over by pushcarts?" he asked.
"We were concerned about Karachi’s law and order situation at that time as well," he added.

Read: No injustice to be done during anti-encroachment drive, says PM Khan

"How did the Supreme Court ruin the law and order situation in Karachi?" the top judge asked. "What is our link to this? Rehabilitation of displaced people and making alternative arrangements for them is the job of the government."

The chief justice said that houses which are still occupied by families of deceased government employees should also be vacated.

He added that the properties that had been given away on pagdi must also be vacated.

"When you ask people like these to vacate their houses, a law and order situation is created," the chief justice remarked.

Justice Nisar expressed his displeasure when Mayor Waseem Akhtar failed to show up on time. When he was told that the mayor was late due to blocked roads and traffic, the chief justice asked: "If other people can arrive on time, why can’t the mayor?"

Justice Nisar said that Karachi Mayor Waseem Akhtar informed the court that he himself had taken the initiative to begin clearing out the encroachments from the areas surrounding Empress Market.

"We had not passed any order at the time, when the mayor began working of his own accord," the chief justice said.

Explore: The ‘clean-up’ of Empress Market doesn’t have to be this way

He asked whether the encroachments around Empress Market had been cleared already, to which the attorney general replied in the affirmative.

"We can't now order that the area be re-encroached," the top judge said.

The advocate general said that the razing shops was leading to rise in unemployment.

"Demolishing one shop takes away the livelihood of a man," he argued.

The chief justice agreed that after the clearance of encroachments, the matter of relocation will arise, but the task of making alternative arrangements for affectees was the Sindh government's responsibility.

"What will happen now is the Sindh government's responsibility. We have not stopped anyone from making alternative arrangements," he said.

"If they want to give the affectees an alternative venue for their shops, they should do it. When did we stop them?" he asked.

The advocate general said that the Sindh government had a plan to relocate the traders who had shops on encroached lands. He appealed to the court to allow the government to relocate the shops and then continue the drive.

The court was told that some traders in areas marked for the anti-encroachment drive slept in their shops. The advocate general added that the government was relocating some affectees of the drive to the Lines Area.
The CJP ordered the mayor, the Centre and the provincial government to submit their plan in court tomorrow.

The chief justice also suggested that the extensions to the National Museum building be razed. However, no order was passed in this regard.

The attorney general, who also appeared in court today, told the bench that a report prepared by the director of the Karachi Development Authority (KDA) revealed that around 35,000 plots in Karachi had been illegally occupied.

He said that no action had been taken on the findings of the report as yet.

City government is 'against qabza mafia'
Karachi Mayor Waseem Akhtar, while talking to the media outside the Supreme Court Karachi registry, said that the city government's agenda was not to raze houses but to restore parks and clear illegal structures built on nullahs.

He claimed that the city authorities were "against the qabza mafia".

He added that the provincial government had appealed to the court to stop the anti-encroachment operation and declared that the drive will continue. Akhtar added that the Sindh government's job was to relocate the affectees.

Owais Muzaffar Tappi to be produced before SC tomorrow
The bench ordered police to produce former president Asif Zardari's foster brother, Owais Muzaffar Tappi, in court tomorrow.

Residents of Shah Latif Town had complained that Tappi, had illegally occupied their plots.

The bench, on the complaint of the citizens, ordered the Additional Inspector General (Legal) to produce Tappi in court tomorrow.
(By Shafi Baloch, Dawn, 11 December 2018)
Umer Farooqi market is no more, but the man lives on in shopkeepers’ hearts

Bilal Farooqi

KARACHI: A barrier of green fabric surrounds the bare land around Karachi’s Empress Market. There’s still some debris scattered across the flattened ground.

The motorists hitting the brakes on the busy adjacent roads turn and look through portions where the cloth has been pulled down. It’s not a sight they’re used to. Just weeks ago, the bustling Umer Farooqi Market and other commercial centres lined up with tiny shops stood over this land for over half a century. But the livelihoods of hundreds of vendors were bulldozed on November 8.

Many are unaware of why it was called the Umer Farooqi Market.
A legacy
In the late 60s, the authorities decided to rid the vicinity around Empress Market of small-time vendors. It was then that Umer Farooqi, founder and editor of an Urdu daily Aghaz, sat down with the vendors, understood their predicament and decided to take a stand.

Edition after edition, he tenaciously took up their cause. His efforts paid off. The Karachi Metropolitan Corporation (Karachi Municipal Corporation back then), rented out space to them next to Empress Market under the West Pakistan Municipal Committees (Property) Rules of 1962. To express their gratitude, they named the market after the editor who had given them a voice.

The Umer Farooqi market was set up in 1968. The vendors acquired space for “cabins” at the market with the payment of advance rent to the KMC. From 1993 onwards, they have been paying six months’ advance rent to the KMC as well as taxes to the provincial government.

The cabins were given the status of shops in 2005 when Niamatullah Khan was the city’s mayor.

Legal tenants
“The government has taken Rs420 million from us so far for 604 shops,” says Mansoor Ahmed Siddique, the joint secretary of the Umer Farooqi Market Association, as he shows the receipts.

“In return, we weren’t even provided with a roof. We built the market, spent money on its maintenance out of our own pockets,” he adds. “I’ve been here for 50 years. They were charging us rent, electricity bills, income tax, etc. If it was illegal, what were they charging us for?”

Siddique also speaks about the vendors’ harrowing experience on November 8. Even tenants who haven’t paid their rent aren’t treated the way the ones paying their rent six months in advance were evicted.
“All the claims about an advance notice to the shopkeepers are untrue,” says Siddique. “We were given three hours to gather our merchandise and move out. How much could we have salvaged? We’ve suffered immense losses. They razed the market in an hour. It’s turned into a graveyard,” he laments.

Asmatullah, another vendor, has rolled out a mat on the bulldozed land. There, he and other vendors are sitting in protest.

“There were eight or nine other markets apart from the Umer Farooqi Market. Overall, there were over 1,700 shops here. How can so many shops be vacated in three hours?” asks Asmatullah.

“We are here for 50 years. My grandfather used to pay Rs5 in rent when he opened a shop here. Now, we were paying Rs300. The shops were officially leased out to us. We were paying all charges,” he adds. “The law-enforcement agencies came and told us move out on such a short notice. Then they demolished everything. We’re poor. How can we stand up against the government?”
Asmatullah says the vendors were given only three hours to grab their goods and vacate. PHOTO: BILAL FAROOQI/EXPRESS

Blame game
Bashir Siddiqui, the KMC Anti-Encroachment director, maintains that the vendors are portraying themselves as victims but they’re not. "They were paying Rs300 in rent. The shops across the road pay Rs50,000. They were making a lot of money," he says. "The KMC approached the courts against this, but the vendors used to obtain a stay order. But now, with the Supreme Court’s orders, they can’t do anything," he adds.

Whether the vendors will be provided with alternative space or not, the official says that’s the mayor’s domain. "My job is to demolish only," he says.

Karachi Mayor Waseem Akhtar has indeed promised that the vendors will be relocated. But it’s unclear how long that will take.

For now, the vendors are approaching political parties and other stakeholders seeking help. Assurances are all they’ve received so far.

But that won’t feed the families back home and they urgently need to start earning again.

Siddique still remembers how an editor had struggled for them all those years ago.
Civil society demands apology and compensation plan
Zia ur Rehman

After holding consultations with residents of low-income neighbourhoods and shopkeepers who were displaced or affected in other ways in the ongoing anti-encroachment drive in the city, civil society organisations and rights activists have demanded that the government stop the drive, tender an apology to the affected people for destroying sources of their livelihoods and implement a fair compensation and rehabilitation plan after forming a committee comprising affected people and pro-people individuals.

The civil society organisations made the demands during a joint press conference held on Friday at the Karachi Press Club. The press conference was organised by the Urban Resource Centre (URC) in collaboration with the Joint Action Committee, Pakistan Institute of Labour Education and Research (Piler), Karachi Urban Lab, Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, National Commission for Human Rights (NCHR) and Aurat Foundation. Expressing severe concern over the anti-encroachment drive, speakers at the press conference lamented that the government completely ignored the human aspect while carrying out the drive.

Prominent urban planner Arif Hasan said the government was not disclosing its plans regarding the areas cleared in the massive anti-encroachment drive. He demanded that the government fully disclose what it intended to do with areas like Empress Market where encroachments had been removed. “Thirty to 40 per cent of the city’s economy is informal and without it, the city could not run its affairs,” Hasan said, adding that the informal economy provided employment to around two million people in the city, including hawkers and small shopkeepers who were deprived of their livelihoods because of the drive.

Throwing light on factors that had caused encroachments to emerge over the years, Hasan said consecutive governments in the past failed to carry out any urban planning for the city and equally failed to provide basic facilities, especially housing, to the people. It was because of the failure of governments that hawkers, instead of shopkeepers, and Katchi Abadis, instead of formal settlements, emerged across the city, he maintained.

Hasan went on to say that the anti-encroachment drive had been carried out illegally as many shops that were demolished had been on lease and the traders who were using them had legal documents.

Anis Haroon, who was representing the NCHR, said the ongoing drive was the biggest demolition drive in the city. Criticising the federal government, she said instead of fulfilling its promise to provide jobs to 10 million people and build five million houses, the government had snatched existing jobs and houses from people.

Zulfiqar Shah from Piler discussed various implications of the anti-encroachment drive for the poor communities. He decried demolition of a large number of shops that did not fall in the category of encroachments, alleging that they were razed in order to grab their land.

Abira Ashfaq, rights activist and lawyer, commented on legal rights of hawkers and shopkeepers, saying that in countries such as India and Cambodia, their rights were protected and regularised. “It is a right of
any hawker to continue running his or her business on a place if the business has been there for the last 20 to 25 years,” she said.

The civil society organisations have been raising the issue of displaced shopkeepers and citizens on multiple fronts. Earlier this week, the URC and HRCP held separate meetings with affected traders and residents of Katchi Abadis to discuss the fallout of the drive.

According to statistics compiled by the URC from newspaper reports, 2,200 shops have been demolished in the Empress Market during the ongoing anti-encroachment drive while 450 shops have been demolished in the Lighthouse market. As many as 350 shops have been levelled in the Aram Bagh Furniture Market while 800 shops on Burnes Road, 1,000 stalls in Shah Faisal Colony No 1, 20 shops in Liaquatabad Supermarket, 480 shops on Sohrab Katrak Road, 450 shops on Shahrah-e-Iraq and 450 shops in the Sohrab Goth area have also been razed among others.

(By Zia Ur Rehman, The News, 08 December 2018)

Civil society activists demand restoration of demolished shops

KARACHI: Arif Hasan, a senior architect and town planner, on Friday demanded the government to tender an apology to the people of Karachi for destroying their source of livelihood in the name of an anti-
encroachment drive. He called for a rehabilitation plan to be prepared for the evictees, not by the
government, but by a committee of experts and people-friendly organisations.

Speaking at a joint press conference with civil society organisations at Karachi Press Club, Hasan said
that the past governments have failed to plan sufficiently for urban areas and were unable to provide
basic facilities to the people, so people got their facilities on their own.

(Un)planned development: The Empress is bare. Now the authorities must play fair

"If the government does not tender an apology, we will not forgive it," he said, claiming that the anti-
encroachment operation is illegal.

Hasan said that the underprivileged were not provided shelters so katchi abadis [slums] emerged,
marketing places for the underprivileged were not planned so hawkers emerged and no bus terminals
were constructed so bus stops emerged on the roads.

“All the affected shop keepers be restored at the same places and they may be compensated by the
government," he said.

During the operation, roughly 14,719 shops have been demolished so far. The number of shops razed in
Empress Market is 1,700, and 296 shops from Lunda Market have been demolished.

According to Hasan, the informal sector provides employment to about two million people, including
hawkers and small shopkeepers, and contributes to 30% to 40% of Pakistan’s economy. He added that
a city’s economy cannot run without the informal sector. He termed the anti-encroachment operation
illegal because many of the shops had been leased out and have legal titles. "We demand the
government to tell us the actual objective of this operation," he said. In a similar vein, Anis Haroon, a
member of the National Commission for Human Rights (NCHR), said that she is taking up the cause of
those affected by the anti-encroachment operation along Karachi Circular Railway (KCR) track. Those
people had been allowed to live on that land in connivance with land grabbers and had paid money for
their abodes in the katchi abadis, she said.

Haroon reiterated that this operation is contrary to the constitution and the law. "We will help them to the
final conclusion," she added. "We appeal to the Supreme Court to not allow such injustice against the
people," she said, adding that this operation may lead to unrest in society.

Umer Farooqi market is no more, but the man lives on in shopkeepers’ hearts

Advocate Abira Ashfaq added that it is the right of hawkers if they have been running a business for the
past 20 to 25 years. She gave the examples of countries like India and Cambodia where rights of hawkers
are protected and regularised. "We are with all those who had 99-year lease and removed, but we are
also with the hawker women, who are sitting outside to sell dry fruits," said Ashfaq.

Meanwhile, Pakistan Institute of Labour Education and Research (PILER) Joint Director Zulfiqar Shah
said that the anti-encroachment drive has affected only low-income people in the city. This may cause
law and order problem, he warned.

Representatives of those affected also spoke on the occasion and called for the government to provide
compensation. The affected representatives included Rasheed Kakar, Ibrahim, Hakeem Shah, Seeta
and others.

(The Express Tribune, 08 December 2018)
Anti-encroachment drive: Govt asked to take experts, affected people on board on rehabilitation plan

KARACHI: “About 30 to 40 per cent of Karachi’s economy is informal, a fact this government ignored when razing all the shops in and around Empress Market while throwing out all the vendors there,” said architect and urban planner Arif Hasan on Friday.

He was speaking at a press conference called by the Urban Resource Centre (URC) along with Joint Action Committee (JAC) of the civil society at the Karachi Press Club.

“The informal economy provides a livelihood to some two million people. And if they encroached upon any place it was because they were living and earning in an unplanned city. There were no proper cargo terminals, bus terminals, toilets, etc, so the people make them on the roads,” he said, explaining: “The vendors took over any spot that they could find because there were no permanent small or retail markets. And as the city grew and places to live became scarce, the katchi abadis also came up.”

Civil society wants to know the real reason behind anti-encroachment drive

“It is sad how the people whose only crime was earning a livelihood were displaced. What happened to them was also against the law because their shops were either leased or rented. Still, they can easily be resettled from where they have been removed,” the town planner pointed out while making some demands.

He demanded that the government share its plan regarding the action. “We demand to know the real reason behind this action,” he said. “We also demand that the ones displaced and deprived of earning a livelihood be rehabilitated and the plan for their rehabilitation be prepared not by the government but a committee of experts, affected people and people-friendly organisations,” he added.

“And we want the government to apologise for what they did. If it doesn’t apologise, these poor people will also not forgive them,” he cautioned.

Anis Haroon, a member of the National Commission for Human Rights, said that it was not the first time that the poor had been swept under the rug.
"Is this the New Pakistan we used to hear about? We had also heard that in this New Pakistan people will not remain jobless or without a roof over their heads. But here they are with their means of earning snatched and because of this they may soon also lose the roof over their heads," she said.

"When the shops had power, gas and water connections, when they were paying rent, then how can they be seen as illegal?" Ms Haroon asked.

Zulfiqar Shah of the Pakistan Institute of Labour Education and Research said that he was an eyewitness to the action.

"I noticed the bulldozers, excavators and trucks all had Bahria Town labels on them. It warrants an investigation," he said, adding that the treatment meted out to the people was in violation of basic human rights.

"Already there is such a huge problem of joblessness in our country and now we have more people to add to them," he said.

Lawyer and teacher Abira Ashfaq said that despite it being said that everything was done according to the orders of the Supreme Court of Pakistan, there was a proper process which was to be followed such as public hearings, issuing 90-day notices, etc.

She also said that it was the right of vendors and hawkers to run their businesses whether they run a business for the last 20-25 years or whether they had a 99-year lease of a shop or whether they sold dried fruits by the footpath. "There is no need to focus on what is lawful or unlawful here. Earning a livelihood the way these people were doing was all right," she added.

Seeta, an effected vendor, said that selling from the footpath they already faced attacks from law enforcers. "They would hurl abuses at us, scold us, beat us and confiscate our baskets and carts. But we would come back after a while because we are proud women, we don’t beg, we earn an honest living," she said.

"After what happened, it is difficult for us to make two ends meet. We cannot even pay rent for our living quarters. Sooner or later we may also be thrown out of our homes," she said.

Ibrahim, who had a shop in the Empress Market, said that this was Muttahida Qaumi Movement’s revenge for not getting votes from Karachi. "It is not our fault that they couldn’t win in the elections but they are doing this through the KMC to show us this is what happens when they are not elected in majority," he said.

(Dawn, 08 December 2018)

(اسٹاف رپورٹر) غیر سرکاری تنظیم پر مشتمل جوائنٹ کمیٹی نے مطالبہ کیا کہ متاثرين کا نقصان ہوا ہے اس کیس کاری ادارے، وفاقی اور صوبائی حکومت سمیت بلدیاتی ادارے مل کر ازالہ کریں۔

(Daily Jang, 08 December 2018)
Dispossession of the poor
Foqia Sadiq Khan

Prime Minister Imran Khan has time and again vowed to work to make the poor better off as a result of the policies of his government; what we have seen so far is dispossession of the poor in the form of anti-encroachment drives and such other measures. As has been said in these pages that his announcement of making large-scale low-cost housing for the poor is laudable, if implemented. However, what is the point of the promise of providing a roof to the poor over their head, when you are callously depriving them of their source of livelihoods?

Amongst others, scholar and architect Arif Hasan has written in the press so compassionately about more than 1,400 shops being demolished in Empress market (Saddar area) of Karachi. It means more than 4,000 hawkers have been evicted. Many of these hawkers and shopkeepers were in Saddar area for that past five decades or so, often inheriting their micro-enterprises from their fathers. Hasan estimates that more than 10,000 families might have lost their livelihoods as the result of eviction carried out in a couple of days. The problem is not restricted to urban areas only. We know of sprawling metropolises and posh housing schemes that displace the rural people from their homes and fields, in order to provide luxurious housing to the elite of this country. Most of the development work translates into the large-scale displacement of the poor against their will. Zubair Torwali has written in the press about fears of mountainous people being displaced of their access to forests and customary law rights in Kumrat Valley, Upper Dir, Malakand division where apparently Imran Khan has announced to build a national park and it was apparently not done in consultation with local people. Torwali has casted this as a curse of development, being part of mission to “civilize” the “savage” and used Edward Said’s “orientalism” lens to explain it.

We offer a different theoretical framework to analyze the dispossession of the urban and rural poor in Pakistan and it is Karl Marx’s “primitive accumulation” that sums it up. Marx wrote eight short chapters in the last Part 8 of his Capital Volume 1 (from Chapters 26-33) and they are an essential read for anyone studying development. Marx studies the “enclosure of the commons” in the historical development of capitalism in Britain. Marx has mainly explained the following two aspects of primitive accumulation: primitive accumulation as the accumulation of resources through mainly non-economic means, and primitive accumulation as the accumulation of surplus value through dispossession labour of its means of production. The two aspects are intertwined. Primitive accumulation is, according to Marx, “a process that transforms, on the one hand, the social means of subsistence and of production into capital, on the other, the immediate producers into wage-labourers.”

As the literature on primitive accumulation informs us that the revolution in agriculture that eventually led to capitalism started in the last three decades of the 15th century and lasted till the end of eighteenth century. The “new nobility” was more interested in earning money by selling wool to emerging manufactures than producing crops. Hence, arable land was turned into pastures. Fewer people were needed to shepherd sheep than to grow crops, therefore, surplus people held by/dependent on landed nobility were driven out of agricultural lands. This was the beginning of the creation of a labour market. The predecessors of would-be capitalist agriculturalists appropriated common lands.

We know of sprawling metropolises and posh housing schemes that displace the rural people from their homes and fields, in order to provide luxurious housing to the elite of this country. Most of the development work translates into the large-scale displacement of the poor against their will.

In the sixteenth century, Church properties were usurped due to reformation of Catholic Church. In this period, Marx states, “(t)he estates of the church were to a large extent given away to rapacious royal favorites, or sold at a nominal price to speculating farmers and citizens, who drove out, en masse, the hereditary sub-tenants and threw their holdings into one. The legally guaranteed property of the poorer folk in a part of the Church’s tithes was confiscated”. Soon after “pauperism” was officially accepted and a rate for the poor was fixed. In the seventeenth century, Crown properties were stolen in violation of law. Theft of Church and Crown properties was a drive toward large capitalist farms. According to Marx, the whole
edifice of capitalism is built on the separation of producer from his means of production. This separation is achieved through largely coercive means.

In the eighteenth century, there is further transformation in the feudal mode of production towards capitalism. Law changes course and actually sides with the forces of appropriation. The British parliament passes “Acts for enclosures of Commons”. Intermediate land proprietors were replaced by tenants and leased farmers. Common land is fully appropriated by the end of eighteenth century.

As we have seen in the historical case of development of capitalism in Britain that it was done by dispossession and coercion and the law largely sided with the would-be capitalists. We are witnessing something similar in today’s Pakistan and other developing countries. Rural and urban poor are being callously deprived of their land, homes, grazing rights, customary rights, right to livelihoods and it is being done in the name of “writ of law” and in Empress market’s case to also “preserve the heritage”. What heritage are we going to protect, where there are no poor in sight?

It is time to emphasize to PTI government in the centre and PPP government in Sindh that the poor do not need their lip service. Any “development” and “writ of law” enforced by dispossessioning the poor is inhumane. If governments cannot work actively to make the poor better off, at least they should not make them worse off. We should all keep on raising our voice on this issue through whatever means at our disposal.

(By Foqia Sadiq Khan, Daily Times, 16 December 2018)
EVICTION PICTORIAL
PROTEST AGAINST EVICTION PICTORIAL
Appendix 2 - Karachi Demolition 2018
Some Video Footage and Video Links

Residents protest anti-encroachment drive in Karachi’s Surjani Town

KMC’s anti-encroachment drive: But what if Empress Market shops were legal? Samaa TV

Frame Market demolition footage

Protest at Supreme Court Registry Office Footage 11 December 2018:
https://www.facebook.com/URCKHI/videos/377629612811683/

Frame Market victim shopkeeper’s Interview footage: URC footage
https://www.facebook.com/URCKHI/videos/891091104615361/

Interview with Mr. Ibrahim Kaka, Evicted Shopkeeper Empress Market: URC Footage
https://www.facebook.com/URCKHI/videos/324361145053397/

Interviews of evicted Shopkeeper of Light House Lunda Bazzar URC Footage:
https://www.facebook.com/URCKHI/videos/201627804057919/

Interview of displaced Shopkeeper of Light House Lunda Bazzar: URC footage
https://www.facebook.com/URCKHI/videos/221368158758204/

Civil Society’s Press Conference, Arif Hasan addressing against Eviction 07 Dec 2018 at Press Club: URC footage
https://www.facebook.com/URCKHI/videos/224549814240024/
Civil Society’s Press Conference 07 Dec 2018; Anis Haroon (NCHR) addressing at Press Club: URC footage
https://www.facebook.com/URCKHI/videos/902641399945246/

Civil Society’s Press Conference 07 Dec 2018 Advocate Abira Ashfaq at Press Club: URC footage
https://www.facebook.com/URCKHI/videos/366807300554672/

Civil Society’s Press Conference 07 Dec 2018; displaced women vendor addressing at Press Club: URC footage
https://www.facebook.com/URCKHI/videos/293857014598779/

Empress Market Evictions; Samaa Video:
https://www.facebook.com/URCKHI/videos/362048294342286/

Eviction in Karachi; URC Footage:
https://www.facebook.com/URCKHI/videos/321502648437317/

Eviction in Karachi; URC Footage:
https://www.facebook.com/URCKHI/videos/2265880820310888/

Anti Encroachment Operation In Saddar Empress Market Karachi: Footage
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wzgrepN6-Ag

The Empress Market Anti-Encroachment Drive
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3WN-TVR8qvA

Grand anti-encroachment operation begins in Karachi’s Saddar